1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
2	FOR THE EASTERN DISTRI	CT OF PENNSYLVANIA -	
3	LISA BARBOUNIS	: CIVIL ACTION NO.	
4	V.	: 19-cv-05030 :	
5	THE MIDDLE EAST FORUM, DANIEL	: :	
6	PIPES and GREG ROMAN	: :	
7	and	: :	
8	DANIEL PIPES, THE MIDDLE EAST FORUM and GREG ROMAN	: :	
9	V.	: :	
10	LISA BARBOUNIS	: STATUS CONFERENCE	
11			
12	James A. Byrne U.S. Courthouse Via videoconference		
13	Philadelphia, PA 19106 December 4, 2020		
14	Com	mencing at 10:04 a.m.	
15	BEFORE THE HONORABLE JOSHUA D. WOLSON		
16			
17			
18			
19			
20		-	
21	Ann Marie Mitchell, CRR, RDR, RMR Official Court Reporter		
22	(267) 299	9-7250	
23	Proceedings taken stenographically	y and prepared utilizing	
24	computer-aided transcription		
25			

1	APPEARANCES:	
2		
3	FOR THE PLAINTIFF/COUNTER	DEREK SMITH LAW GROUP, PLLC BY: SETH D. CARSON, ESQUIRE
4	DEFENDANT	1835 Market Street Suite 2950
5		Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 (215) 391-4790
6		seth@dereksmithlaw.com
7		
8	FOR THE	COZEN O'CONNOR BY: DAVID J. WALTON, ESQUIRE
9	CLAIMANTS	BY: LEIGH ANN BENSON, ESQUIRE BY: LEIGH ANN BENSON, ESQUIRE
10		One Liberty Place 1650 Market Street, Suite 2800
11		Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 (215) 665-2000
12		dwalton@cozen.com
13		<pre>jcavalier@cozen.com lbenson@cozen.com</pre>
14		
15	FOR THE DEFENDANT/COUNTER	SIDNEY L. GOLD & ASSOCIATES, PC BY: SIDNEY L. GOLD, ESQUIRE
16	CLAIMANT GREG	BY: WILLIAM REISER, ESQUIRE
17	ROMAN	Eleven Penn Center, Suite 515 1835 Market Street Philadalahia Pannaulania 10103
18		Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 (215) 569-1999
19		sgold@discrimlaw.net breiser@discrimlaw.net
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

- 1 (Court called to order at 10:04 a.m.)
- 2 THE COURT: Good morning.
- 3 So I called this hearing to address sanctions issues.
- 4 I have issued a series of orders through the course of the last
- 5 six or seven weeks in this case, and I want to get a handle on
- 6 compliance with those orders, and also talk about big picture
- 7 where things stand, and then try to sort out what, if any,
- 8 remedies are appropriate.
- 9 So I want to start with this. Mr. Carson, on November
- 10 the 17th, I issued an order to show cause concerning sanctions
- 11 in the case. And I laid out sanctions that I was considering.
- 12 It's Document 77 on the docket.
- I laid out the sanctions I was considering, and I
- 14 required responses by November the 20th. And you never
- 15 responded to that order.
- So just on its face, why shouldn't I just enter the
- 17 sanctions that I laid out in that order to show cause given the
- 18 lack of a response?
- I can't hear you, Mr. Carson.
- MR. CARSON: Can you hear me now?
- THE COURT: Yes.
- MR. CARSON: So the first thing is, is that I did file
- 23 a motion for reconsideration on the order.
- When that order came out, it was in the midst of doing
- 25 I guess depositions, and I just fell behind on my email and I

- 1 just -- on my emails and I didn't see the -- I didn't see the
- 2 deadline.
- 3 And I -- you know what I mean? I'm just working on
- 4 this case alone, and ultimately, I filed a motion for
- 5 reconsideration.
- And I think it's pretty clear that based on just the
- 7 facts, that there hasn't been any discovery violations in this
- 8 case, not one.
- 9 THE COURT: I'm not -- we're not there yet. Okay?
- I'm troubled, Mr. Carson, because -- I don't
- 11 understand the explanation that -- I mean, I understand falling
- 12 behind on your emails, but when courts issue orders, you need
- 13 to read the orders. And when courts impose deadlines, you need
- 14 to comply with the deadlines.
- I presume you saw that there was a filing from the
- 16 defendants in response to my order to show cause, which I think
- 17 was Document 80 on the docket.
- I just don't understand how when an order to show
- 19 cause comes out, it can just go unnoticed. That, frankly,
- 20 doesn't make a lot of sense to me.
- 21 And it -- you couple that with the fact that -- and I
- 22 want to be clear, your motion for reconsideration is not
- 23 directed at the issue that led to my order to show cause.
- So my order to show cause was triggered by the fact
- 25 that on November 13th I issued an order. That's the order to

- 1 which your motion is directed.
- 2 But your motion is directed to the portion of that or
- 3 two portions of that order: One that deals with text message
- 4 production and one that deals with an award of attorney fees.
- 5 What it's not directed at and also what it doesn't
- 6 address, Mr. Carson, is the fact that on November 13th, my
- 7 order said that you needed to start providing me with daily
- 8 updates on your progress on doing document review. And I
- 9 didn't get any updates from you. Not a single one. Right?
- And so then I issue an order to show cause saying you
- 11 haven't complied with my order. And I still didn't get any
- 12 updates from you.
- So -- and I know that you didn't just miss that
- 14 obligation, because it wasn't just something that popped up in
- 15 an email or in an ECF notice, it's something we went over on
- 16 the record in a hearing.
- So you didn't comply with that order either. And then
- 18 that's what led to my order to show cause.
- 19 So why weren't you complying with my order?
- 20 MR. CARSON: Well, I think that my motion for
- 21 reconsideration does address that. It does address the images
- 22 too. So --
- 23 THE COURT: It doesn't -- no. It addresses your
- 24 efforts to produce the images, Mr. Carson. Okay? And we'll
- 25 talk about that.

- 1 But it doesn't address the fact that on November 13th
- 2 I issued an order. The order says, okay -- and we talked about
- 3 this, as I said, on the record. It says, "It is FURTHER
- 4 ORDERED" -- and this is Document 74 on the docket. "It is
- 5 FURTHER ORDERED that starting today, and every day thereafter,
- 6 Plaintiff's Counsel shall submit a daily status report to the
- 7 Court via email to" Chambers of -- to the email address,
- 8 Chambers of Judge Wolson, "that sets forth the following
- 9 information: 1) how many documents you reviewed that day; 2)
- 10 how many documents were produced that day; and 3) how much time
- 11 he spent reviewing and/or producing documents that day."
- 12 You didn't submit a status report on the 13th, right,
- 13 which is the date of the order. You didn't submit a status
- 14 report over that weekend. You didn't submit a status report
- 15 the following Monday. I issued an order to show cause. And
- 16 you continued not to issue status reports.
- You knew that that order was there. Right?
- And your reconsideration order doesn't say I should
- 19 never have to submit daily status reports, does it?
- MR. CARSON: It doesn't say that.
- 21 THE COURT: And you didn't comply with my order.
- 22 Right?
- MR. CARSON: I did not send you daily status reports.
- 24 THE COURT: So why didn't you comply with my order?
- MR. CARSON: I mean, because I'm not represented by

- 1 anyone today, just -- what I will -- I don't know what I feel
- 2 feeling comfortable saying.
- 3 But what I would say is it was not -- it was not
- 4 because I read your order and chose not to comply. That is not
- 5 what happened, Your Honor. It just isn't.
- 6 THE COURT: Whether you read it and chose not to
- 7 comply or didn't pay attention to it -- I mean, again, this
- 8 didn't come out of nowhere, Mr. Carson. This is something that
- 9 I raised with you on -- I mean, the order was November 13th,
- 10 but there was a hearing November 13th, right, that the order
- 11 came from.
- And at the end of that hearing, I took a break, and
- 13 then I came back and I read to you into the record what I
- 14 wanted to do. And I told you that I wanted you to provide
- 15 these emails updates, these daily updates. Right?
- So I'm just befuddled at the idea that I told you and
- 17 then I issued an order telling you to do it, requiring you to
- 18 do it, and you just didn't do it.
- So I don't know whether that is I consciously chose
- 20 not to do it or what other way you would describe it, but at
- 21 some level you disregarded my order. And then you disregarded
- 22 the order to show cause saying, hey, I really meant it.
- Tell me why you're not complying.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor, I guess what I just want you
- 25 to know is I absolutely did not just disregard your order

- 1 consciously. The entire time I was working diligently on
- 2 trying to figure out what to do with these images.
- I think that, you know, there's a lot of evidence to
- 4 demonstrate that of the date of that hearing, which was a
- 5 Friday morning, until the present, you know, my entire practice
- 6 has been trying to figure out what to do with these images.
- 7 You know, there's a lot of them, and I thought that I was
- 8 complying with the order by putting that much time and effort
- 9 into working on the images.
- THE COURT: I don't know how you could have thought
- 11 you were complying with the order. Yes, I wanted you to do the
- 12 work, Mr. Carson, but I wanted you to tell me what was going
- 13 on. And the reason I wanted to do that was, A, so I made sure
- 14 there was progress being made, and B, to give me an opportunity
- 15 to be involved if there was something I needed to be involved
- 16 with as we were coming up on the discovery cutoff.
- 17 Instead, I didn't hear from you basically until
- 18 discovery ended. You sent me an update at the time that you
- 19 filed your motion for reconsideration, and that was, you know,
- 20 the evening of the 25th, which was the day of the discovery
- 21 cutoff.
- MR. CARSON: And then I sent a few updates after that.
- 23 THE COURT: And you sent updates after that. But you
- 24 didn't send updates during the discovery period, which is
- 25 expressly what I ordered you to do.

- And the fact that you didn't do it, you didn't comply
- 2 with that requirement and then you didn't respond to the order
- 3 to show cause, just tells me that you're not really paying
- 4 attention.
- 5 You may think you're complying with the spirit of what
- 6 I'm trying to do, but that's not how court orders work. You
- 7 don't get to divine what the spirit of the order is and then
- 8 try to comply with that. You've got to comply with what I
- 9 said. And if there's some reason you can't comply, you've got
- 10 to tell me that, not just ignore it. That's how it's got to
- 11 work.
- And it's not how it worked here. And that's the first
- 13 reason that, you know, we're having this hearing, is because
- 14 I'm looking at this docket and I see a consistent disregard of
- 15 my orders.
- I'll give you a chance, Mr. Carson, on this particular
- 17 issue. Tell me why that's not sanctionable conduct.
- MR. CARSON: Yes. What I would suggest is that there
- 19 is no -- there's -- I mean, first, I don't think there's been
- 20 any prejudice to defendants in any way because I didn't send
- 21 those updates.
- I know that the order -- I understand that -- today
- 23 that that's what the order says, but, you know, there's no way
- 24 that anyone could have gotten through the images that were --
- 25 that I was ordered to go through faster than what I've done. I

- 1 mean, it just wouldn't be possible.
- 2 THE COURT: I'm not interested yet -- we're going to
- 3 get to the images. I'm not interested yet in the images.
- 4 And I hear your prejudice argument, Mr. Carson. But
- 5 I've got to tell you that there's a concern that from my end is
- 6 bigger than the question of prejudice to the defendants and
- 7 frankly is bigger than the prosecution of this case. Right?
- 8 It strikes fundamentally at the justice system and at the
- 9 system of law.
- When judges issue orders, they have to be complied
- 11 with and the parties are not just free to disregard them. You
- 12 can come back to me, and if there's a problem with compliance,
- 13 you can tell me and we can talk about that. But you cannot
- 14 come back to me and just say later, well, it didn't hurt
- 15 anybody so I didn't really have to comply. That's not how our
- 16 system has to work. Our system has to work in a way that there
- 17 is compliance.
- And again, here what I was asking for, right now what
- 19 we're talking about, what led to the order to show cause and
- 20 then subsequently to this hearing is in no small part the
- 21 simple lack of daily updates. Okay?
- 22 And I don't care what you say about the challenge of
- 23 reviewing the documents or anything else. All the things that
- 24 you tell me now that you were doing for the last three or four
- 25 weeks and all of the things that you reported to me in the

- 1 status update on the 25th that you provided, those are things
- 2 that I should have been hearing along the way. Right? That
- 3 was the express purpose of requiring the daily updates.
- 4 So if you had said to me in a daily update, I haven't
- 5 reviewed any documents today but I've been on the phone with
- 6 Cornerstone exploring ways to speed up the review of images,
- 7 for example, that would have been an update that would have
- 8 been useful to me and meaningful and in compliance with my
- 9 order. Okav?
- But you deprived me of that information. You ignored
- 11 a court order. And so just regardless of prejudice, I think
- 12 that there's a bigger issue, as I said. And that is that I
- 13 need to know that when I issue an order, you're going to comply
- 14 with it.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor, can I tell you something else
- 16 that might be relevant?
- 17 THE COURT: Yeah.
- MR. CARSON: So the paralegal I work with today, his
- 19 name is Jason.
- Jason, he works with two lawyers here, and the other
- 21 lawyer is Erica Shikunov. And Erica Shikunov has a case that
- 22 she's litigating against the Middle East Forum.
- So like we've tried to I guess put up like a wall
- 24 between us, just so that we can say that, you know, like, we're
- 25 not sharing information behind -- I mean, like that everything

- 1 is being done as if we were like two different firms.
- 2 And so part of that was that Jason would only work on
- 3 Erica's case.
- 4 So he's the person I sort of always relied to, when
- 5 like orders come through, to like talk about those orders. And
- 6 I didn't realize because of this wall he was just not telling
- 7 me about orders from -- in this case, like he was sort of just
- 8 disregarding them. And I think he thought he was doing the
- 9 right thing by doing that, but at the same time, you know what
- 10 I mean, that's one of the reasons I didn't see the orders.
- 11 THE COURT: So I have two reactions to that,
- 12 Mr. Carson.
- One is I get what you're saying, but, you know, the
- 14 issue is ultimately yours.
- MR. CARSON: Yeah, I understand that.
- THE COURT: It's not your paralegal's. Right?
- Secondly, though, I come back to, you know, this issue
- 18 of the daily reports. Okay?
- 19 Set aside the order to show cause for a second. You
- 20 say you missed that in the email stream. I mean, again, I
- 21 understand maybe not seeing it as it came in, but at some point
- 22 your practice has to be that you're looking at things that have
- 23 an ECF email address because that's how courts issue orders in
- 24 this day and age. And you know in this particular case that,
- 25 A, I've been actively involved over the last six or seven

- 1 weeks, and B, that you're coming up on the discovery cutoff.
- 2 But even beyond that, okay, again, I'm looking at the
- 3 transcript now from November 13. And November 13th is the
- 4 hearing that leads to the order.
- 5 And I said on the record, okay, I said, the last
- 6 thing, Mr. Carson, once I get a report from Cornerstone, I
- 7 said, it may be that there's not much left to review once the
- 8 attachments are produced, but to the extent that there are
- 9 still media files that need to be produced, I want to see daily
- 10 updates on the progress of the that. And I want those by email
- 11 to my Chambers.
- So I'm going to get a report from you on Monday about
- 13 what's out there.
- 14 Hopefully what you can tell me is both what's out
- 15 there in the way of media files but also how many of them are
- 16 attachments that are going to be produced and what's going to
- 17 be left for review.
- And you say to me, how am I going to get you that
- 19 information?
- 20 And I say, you're going to email me to the Chambers
- 21 account, Mr. Carson. You're going to copy counsel on the case
- 22 how many files you've reviewed on a daily basis so that I have
- 23 information about the progress that's being made. I want to
- 24 know the files that have been reviewed and the amount of time
- 25 that's spent reviewing them on a daily basis. And you're going

- 1 to send emails to my Chambers account telling me that.
- 2 This wasn't just an order. This wasn't something that
- 3 a paralegal had to see and alert you to. This is something you
- 4 and I had a direct dialogue about.
- 5 And --
- 6 MR. CARSON: And the parties did email a status update
- 7 that following week. Right?
- 8 THE COURT: Yeah, I got a status update, which is a
- 9 separate requirement. But I told you I wanted daily updates.
- 10 The exchange we just had that I read to you was for daily
- 11 updates. And I didn't get them. Right?
- And that's not on your paralegal. None of this is on
- 13 your paralegal.
- 14 MR. CARSON: No. I don't put any of it -- I wasn't
- 15 suggesting it was his fault. But like the reason why -- the
- 16 way that I just found out about that, that like -- was
- 17 absolutely because of this hearing. You know, the hearing was
- 18 something I just knew, you know, that I had this Friday on my
- 19 mind.
- 20 So the other -- I think it was yesterday, actually, or
- 21 might have been the day before when I looked at my calendar and
- 22 I didn't see the hearing on my calendar, I was like, you know,
- 23 what the heck, why isn't -- you know, that's an important
- 24 hearing. If I didn't remember it, that could be a real
- 25 problem.

- 1 So I went to say something to Jason about it, and
- 2 that's when I just found out he wasn't putting things on my
- 3 calendar for any MEF case. So I didn't know that was
- 4 happening.
- 5 THE COURT: But again, it doesn't matter. You and I
- 6 had conversation about it. And I'm pretty sure you ordered the
- 7 transcript. I'm pretty sure I saw that.
- 8 MR. CARSON: I have a transcript.
- 9 THE COURT: So you knew it was a requirement that I
- 10 imposed. Regardless -- maybe you forgot, but there was a point
- 11 in time where you knew that that was a requirement that I
- 12 imposed, and you didn't comply with it.
- MR. CARSON: I was at the hearing.
- 14 THE COURT: There's no question about that.
- I don't know yet -- and we'll go through some other
- 16 stuff today and then I'll figure out what the remedy is for
- 17 that, but it's clear to me on the record that you knew about my
- 18 orders. And frankly, to the extent you didn't know about the
- 19 order requiring the response to the order to show cause, that's
- 20 more than just negligence from my perspective.
- You get ECF notices from a court, you've got to look
- 22 at them. It's kind of basic.
- And, you know, so whether you had actual knowledge or
- 24 just constructive knowledge of that requirement, I don't know.
- 25 I don't have to decide whether you actually read the order.

- 1 The purpose of giving ECF notices is so that you have
- 2 constructive knowledge. And you didn't, and you didn't respond
- 3 to the order to show cause.
- 4 Let me ask then, you know, there's some other issues
- 5 that are raised in the defendants' submission in response to
- 6 the order to show cause and that also seem to suggest that
- 7 there was noncompliance with my order, at least my November
- 8 13th order. And we'll get into some of the early orders as we
- 9 go through today.
- So I'm going to come back to the text messages in a
- 11 minute.
- 12 Attachments. There was an order that you produce
- 13 attachments with metadata for previously produced documents and
- 14 that that had to be done by November 18th.
- Did that happen?
- 16 MR. CARSON: The order -- the order was I had to
- 17 authorize Cornerstone to do it.
- 18 THE COURT: It's ultimately your job to make a
- 19 production. Cornerstone is not some independent party here.
- MR. CARSON: They're the only party with the metadata,
- 21 Your Honor. They're the only people that have it.
- THE COURT: What did you do to make sure Cornerstone
- 23 made the production?
- MR. CARSON: I contacted them and told them to produce
- 25 it.

- 1 THE COURT: Did you follow up to see if they produced
- 2 it?
- 3 MR. CARSON: They refused to produce it. They will
- 4 not produce that information in this case. They will not do
- 5 it.
- 6 THE COURT: So we'll get to that in a minute.
- 7 Did you -- there's discussion in the report that you
- 8 were, I would say, not terribly involved in the discussions
- 9 with Cornerstone on the 13th, and then on the 17th -- that you
- 10 didn't talk to them at all on the 13th because you had another
- 11 deposition going on, and then on the 17th you were on for about
- 12 ten minutes and then hung up and then left the Cozen lawyers --
- 13 and I have to look and see whether Mr. Gold or his colleagues
- 14 were also on, but left the defense lawyers to talk to
- 15 Cornerstone alone; is that right?
- MR. CARSON: Yes and no. I wasn't invited to the call
- 17 on the 13th. That's wasn't a call -- that was just a call that
- 18 those guys had with Cornerstone without me. It wasn't set up
- 19 to be a conference call.
- THE COURT: I have an email here where Mr. Walton
- 21 emails you and says -- and two people from Cornerstone asking
- 22 to speak as soon as possible.
- And you wrote back, saying, I don't think I'll be able
- 24 to talk until Monday. Right?
- Mr. Walton says, we really need to discuss it today.

- 1 And so then they went ahead without you because you weren't
- 2 available.
- 3 MR. CARSON: I was in a deposition that whole day.
- 4 THE COURT: Right. You told me that at the hearing,
- 5 and I told you that I still needed you to find a way to make
- 6 yourself available to have conversations. Right?
- 7 MR. CARSON: Yeah, by Monday. And we did have a
- 8 conversation by Monday.
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. And on Monday how long were you on
- 10 the phone with Cornerstone?
- MR. CARSON: 15 minutes.
- 12 THE COURT: The call continued. Why didn't you stay
- 13 on?
- MR. CARSON: We all agreed that I had provided enough
- 15 information, that Dave was -- I mean, it wasn't that everyone
- 16 was asking me to stay on. I got on the call, we had a
- 17 conversation, we talked about everything, I told Cornerstone
- 18 that they were a totally -- had my authorization to finish
- 19 talking to Dave, if Dave had a lot more questions. And Dave
- 20 decided to stay on because had more questions and stayed on to
- 21 talk to them.
- I was part of the call, and we did talk about
- 23 everything. And he did explain exactly what the issues were
- 24 during that call, and I did respond to it all.
- 25 THE COURT: Did you give to the defendants or propose

- 1 a schedule for producing text messages at that time?
- 2 MR. CARSON: Did I do what?
- 3 THE COURT: Give them a proposed schedule for
- 4 production of text messages that I ordered?
- 5 MR. CARSON: I don't even -- no. But they didn't
- 6 provide -- by the time that that conversation happened, I don't
- 7 think I even had the list of text messages I had to provide
- 8 yet.
- 9 THE COURT: Set aside that conversation. Okay?
- 10 So my order of November 13th, Mr. Carson, said that
- 11 there was some intermediate deadlines because I wanted things
- 12 to move. Right?
- And then what I said was -- pull up the order again.
- 14 So we talked about the production of documents -- of
- 15 attachments. You said Cornerstone refused to do that.
- Then I said you were to provide to me a status report
- 17 with regard to a schedule for producing text messages pursuant
- 18 to the requirements that I had already ordered.
- MR. CARSON: We did that.
- THE COURT: They gave you a list of text
- 21 conversations. Right?
- MR. CARSON: Yeah.
- THE COURT: And you were supposed to provide them with
- 24 a schedule to get them produced.
- They did ultimately give you a list. Right?

- 1 MR. CARSON: Yeah. There was about 578 threads on the
- 2 list.
- 3 THE COURT: What did you do to give them a schedule to
- 4 produce?
- 5 MR. CARSON: Your Honor, the only people with those
- 6 text messages is Cornerstone. The only people in the world
- 7 that have those text messages are Cornerstone. There's nobody
- 8 else in the world. Lisa doesn't have them. I don't have them.
- 9 I talked -- I had plenty of conversations -- me and
- 10 Dave Walton have been -- were in direct communication that
- 11 entire time. We had several conversations on the telephone.
- 12 We traded electronic communications. And I responded to it
- 13 all.
- And we sat on the phone, and I tried -- like he had --
- 15 we pulled up the list together that they gave me, the entire --
- 16 the entire Excel spreadsheet. And I sat there and tried to
- 17 figure out with him on the phone whether or not I could respond
- 18 to it.
- And I explained to him, there's no way I could do it.
- 20 I don't even have these text messages.
- 21 THE COURT: I'm going to shift gears a little, go a
- 22 little out of my planned order then, because I keep hearing
- 23 Cornerstone, Mr. Carson. I've heard it throughout the case.
- 24 You invoke Cornerstone. They have the data, they're the ones
- 25 who have to produce, they refuse to do things. Okay?

- 1 And then I got this status update from the parties in
- 2 which I was told, well, Cornerstone hasn't been retained in
- 3 this case. Is that right?
- 4 MR. CARSON: I guess that's what the status update
- 5 says.
- 6 THE COURT: Is that right? Did you retain Cornerstone
- 7 in this case?
- 8 MR. CARSON: No. Defendants are paying for
- 9 Cornerstone.
- 10 THE COURT: In this case or in the trade secret case?
- MR. CARSON: Just period. They're covering all the
- 12 bills for Cornerstone. I have not been -- and that was part of
- 13 an agreement, because we -- frankly, plaintiff couldn't afford
- 14 it.
- 15 THE COURT: I thought Cornerstone -- the report I got
- 16 was that Cornerstone had only been engaged pursuant to Judge
- 17 Sanchez's order in the trade secret case. Is that right,
- 18 Mr. Carson?
- MR. CARSON: That's what Cornerstone's position is, is
- 20 that they can't do discovery -- they're fine with producing
- 21 discovery as long as it's in -- as long as it's parallel to
- 22 what they're doing in the other case.
- THE COURT: I assume there's some engagement letter
- 24 with Cornerstone somewhere. Right?
- MR. CARSON: Not -- I don't have one.

- 1 THE COURT: There's no agreement with Cornerstone to
- 2 be hired?
- 3 MR. CARSON: Not between --
- 4 THE COURT: You don't have any kind of contractual
- 5 terms?
- 6 MR. CARSON: No, not -- I don't have one, no.
- 7 THE COURT: Mr. Gold, you're in the trade secret case.
- 8 Is there an engagement letter with Cornerstone?
- 9 MR. GOLD: To my recollection there is, Your Honor.
- 10 However, it is strictly related to the trade secret case.
- And Cornerstone is not a vendor of the -- of the
- 12 Middle East Forum. Cornerstone is a neutral party that was
- 13 brought in to kind of facilitate the discovery in the trade
- 14 secret case.
- However, the Forum was paying Cornerstone, but
- 16 Cornerstone was never retained in this case, to either be our
- 17 expert, nor was Cornerstone ever retained to be Mr. Carson's
- 18 expert. So --
- 19 And Cornerstone is limited in terms of the information
- 20 it can disclose or the data it can produce by virtue of Judge
- 21 Sanchez's order, who, by the way, kept Cornerstone as a neutral
- 22 party. And basically they -- the information that's been
- 23 uploaded to their platform is discoverable by the attorneys in
- 24 that case, who happens to be Mr. Carson as well.
- 25 But Cornerstone has nothing to do with this case. And

- 1 to the extent to which the information is parallel to the
- 2 information that they produced in the trade secret case,
- 3 Mr. Carson is -- you know, has access to it, but Mr. Carson has
- 4 never retained an e-vendor in this case.
- 5 MR. WALTON: That's right.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay. So this is where I have some
- 7 problems, Mr. Carson, because when you say to things to me like
- 8 Cornerstone refused to produce documents with attachments or
- 9 produce documents with metadata, okay, it's not Cornerstone's
- 10 obligation to do that. It's your obligation.
- MR. CARSON: Right, Your Honor. The parties agreed --
- 12 there's a reason why we agreed to use the discovery from the
- 13 trade secret case in this case, and that's because all the
- 14 keywords -- it's all the same parties, it's all the same
- 15 entities. So we have hundreds of thousands of documents that
- 16 form a super broad production in the other case, and we both --
- 17 and the parties agreed, like, why not try to parlay that for
- 18 this case.
- 19 THE COURT: Mr. Carson, I'm all for -- Mr. Carson, I'm
- 20 all for agreements that create efficiencies.
- MR. CARSON: Right.
- THE COURT: And that's fine. But it doesn't absolve
- 23 you of your discovery obligations in this case.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor --
- 25 THE COURT: And so -- and so you can't say to me, oh,

- 1 we agreed to use Cornerstone, who is engaged in Judge Sanchez's
- 2 case.
- I mean, I haven't studied them, but I did pull the
- 4 orders from Judge Sanchez's case where he directs you to use
- 5 Cornerstone.
- 6 Here's the thing. Ultimately, it's not my problem.
- 7 Okay? It's your problem how you get the defendants the data to
- 8 which they're entitled. But they are entitled, not just
- 9 because of my order but because of the Federal Rules of Civil
- 10 Procedure, to metadata that will allow them to the parent-child
- 11 relationships of ESI that you have produced. And I don't
- 12 care --
- Mr. Carson, I can see you, so I can see you smirking
- 14 at me and rolling your eyes.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor, I'm by no means smirking at
- 16 you and rolling my eyes. What I am doing is expressing
- 17 frustration, because I don't even know what that means, what
- 18 the parent-child relationship is, and --
- 19 THE COURT: That's part of the problem. It is your
- 20 responsibility to know that.
- MR. CARSON: But, Your Honor --
- 22 THE COURT: First of all, we raised this at an earlier
- 23 hearing. We talked about it. So if you didn't know what it
- 24 meant, you either had to ask or go educate yourself.
- MR. CARSON: Right. And today I think I have an

- 1 understanding, but the order that you issued on November 13th,
- 2 there is only one company on the planet that can comply with
- 3 that order, and that's Cornerstone. Like there's nobody --
- 4 because your order was to -- for text messages to be produced
- 5 based on snippets that Cornerstone produced. So you didn't
- 6 just order, Your Honor, that plaintiff had to produce text
- 7 threads generally. What you ordered is that plaintiff had to
- 8 produce text threads for hits based on a discovery production
- 9 that Cornerstone originally produced.
- 10 THE COURT: Right. Because you have told me
- 11 throughout the case that you have been relying on Cornerstone.
- 12 Okay? So for me to now find out that somehow Cornerstone is
- 13 not your vendor -- I don't care who's paying them, okay --
- 14 they're not your vendor and they don't have to do what you say
- 15 is problematic. Because my -- the discovery obligations in
- 16 this case are not the discovery obligations in the trade secret
- 17 case.
- MR. CARSON: But Your Honor, the parties agreed to do
- 19 it that way. You're blaming me for an agreement the parties
- 20 made. Like we got to this point because the parties worked it
- 21 out that we were going to do it this way. And then Your
- 22 Honor --
- THE COURT: Mr. Carson, if you've agreed to use
- 24 Cornerstone in this case, that's fine with me. Okay?
- Unless you can show me an agreement that you've agreed

- 1 to be bound in this case by the confidentiality orders and
- 2 other restrictions that exist in the trade secret case, then
- 3 that's not the same as using Cornerstone.
- 4 And if you need to use Cornerstone in this case
- 5 differently than they are being used in Judge Sanchez's case,
- 6 then you need to make arrangements for that to happen.
- 7 And if you need cost sharing, if you need something
- 8 like that, then you needed to talk to the defendants and raise
- 9 it with me. You never have.
- MR. CARSON: I mean, we -- Your Honor, we don't even
- 11 have those text messages. I mean, the text messages on the
- 12 list, it's a list of text messages -- first of all, it's not a
- 13 list of text messages. So that's not what it is. It's a list
- 14 of every electronic communication snippet from every method
- 15 of -- from every social media app, every email, every
- 16 electronic message that was sent on like nine different
- 17 platforms.
- There is only one party on the plant that has access
- 19 to that information. There's --
- THE COURT: Mr. Carson, where did Cornerstone get that
- 21 data?
- MR. CARSON: From a dump that was done on cell phones
- 23 in February.
- THE COURT: And whose cell phones were they?
- MR. CARSON: They were Lisa's.

- 1 THE COURT: They're still her phones.
- 2 MR. CARSON: I don't even know if she has them
- 3 anymore. She has --
- 4 THE COURT: Either she has them or Cornerstone has
- 5 them. Right?
- 6 MR. CARSON: No. I --
- 7 THE COURT: Or whoever this -- there was a third
- 8 party, right, at some point that I saw that Judge Sanchez had
- 9 ordered I guess to do the forensic imaging of the phones; is
- 10 that right?
- MR. CARSON: Yeah. They haven't been involved for a
- 12 while. It's Capsicum.
- 13 THE COURT: Someone has the phones. Or if they don't
- 14 have the phones, then the phones were destroyed, which is a
- 15 problem too. But one of two things is true. Okay? Either,
- 16 one, the phones exist and Ms. Barbounis has the right to access
- 17 them because they're hers to make productions of data in this
- 18 case, whether it's through Cornerstone or another vendor. So
- 19 you can say to me, we don't have the text messages, but that's
- 20 not quite right, because the phones exist and they belong to
- 21 Ms. Barbounis.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor, accessing 567 threads on
- 23 the -- I mean, we looked on her phone, because all this is done
- 24 when you update an iPhone. It doesn't matter what phone you
- 25 have, it updates, you known what I mean, all your information.

- 1 So like we looked on her phone. She doesn't even have
- 2 568 threads of messages.
- 3 THE COURT: Okay. But the data that Cornerstone has
- 4 is data that they extracted from Ms. Barbounis's phone. Right?
- 5 MR. CARSON: Not just her phones -- from her phones.
- 6 From her social media accounts, from her email accounts, from
- 7 her cloud-based storage accounts. It's more than just her
- 8 phones.
- 9 THE COURT: But it all came from her accounts. Right?
- 10 Her phones, her account.
- 11 MR. CARSON: Right.
- 12 THE COURT: It all belongs to her. Cornerstone may be
- 13 holding it, but it seems to me she has a right to it too.
- If she doesn't have a right to it, to get it from
- 15 Cornerstone, because I don't know what the terms of your
- 16 agreement with Cornerstone are, then some other vendor can go
- 17 through the exact same exercise.
- Now, I agree with you from an efficiency standpoint
- 19 that it makes no sense to start over with a new vendor and ask
- 20 a new vendor to go make the same forensic images and the same
- 21 forensic collection because that's a time-consuming and
- 22 expensive process.
- 23 MR. CARSON: Like \$30,000.
- 24 THE COURT: So if you look at it in this case and
- 25 said, we're not going to go do that again, we're going to start

- 1 with that universe of materials that Cornerstone has, that's
- 2 fine. And that makes eminent sense to me. Okay?
- 3 But then you get to the next step, because that's your
- 4 starting universe of materials to produce. But then from that
- 5 universe you've got a production that gets made in the trade
- 6 secret case and you've got a production that has to get made in
- 7 this case. And there may be overlap. Right? If you think
- 8 about the Venn diagram of them, they may be overlapped, they
- 9 may be substantially overlapped. But they're not the same, and
- 10 they're not subject to the same protective orders or anything
- 11 else.
- And if Cornerstone hasn't been engaged to do the work
- 13 in this case to provide the production in this case, even to
- 14 the extent it's overlapping with what's done in the trade
- 15 secret case, then they should have been, because that's where
- 16 we seem to have a problem.
- MR. CARSON: I know. They refuse to be, though. I
- 18 told them to.
- 19 THE COURT: No, no, no. They refuse to take the
- 20 action, because you don't have an engagement letter with them
- 21 for this case.
- MR. CARSON: No. That's not right. They refuse to
- 23 allow me to engage them.
- 24 THE COURT: Okay. Well, then that's -- I guess that's
- 25 because of the nature of their engagement in the trade secret

- 1 case.
- MR. CARSON: That's right.
- 3 THE COURT: Then you needed to get some other vendor
- 4 in.
- 5 MR. CARSON: But that's not what you ordered, Your
- 6 Honor. You order was that we go to Cornerstone and ask them to
- 7 do this.
- 8 THE COURT: And Mr. Carson, this is why I asked for
- 9 regular updates, so we could deal with this and not be a
- 10 week-and-a-half after the close of discovery and dealing with
- 11 this.
- And I don't disagree with you, Mr. Carson. And I've
- 13 said it before in this case, that to some extent the delays in
- 14 this case and the problems that we've encountered are problems
- 15 from -- that are to some extent of the defendants' making too,
- 16 because there was a substantial delay in raising a lot of these
- 17 issues. They shouldn't have been raised in October. They
- 18 should have been pressed through in June, July, and I should
- 19 have been hearing about them in -- I understand early, early in
- 20 the discovery process it was early days of the pandemic. I'm
- 21 sure that people were looking around, going, I don't know what
- 22 to do with myself. That's fine.
- There was ample time after we realized things were
- 24 going to progress for everybody to push forward on these
- 25 issues, and they didn't. And I understand that. And I don't

- 1 disagree with that point.
- 2 But that doesn't absolve you of your obligations,
- 3 Mr. Carson, to comply with discovery in the case.
- 4 So if Cornerstone is saying to you that they won't be
- 5 involved in this case and they're not going to allow you to
- 6 direct them to make productions in this case of the things that
- 7 are relevant in this case and that I am ordering produced in
- 8 this case, then someone has to. Okay?
- 9 And whether that means getting another -- if they
- 10 don't want to do it, I don't think I need a third party neutral
- 11 in this case. Okay? I can see why a trade secret case is very
- 12 differently positioned than this case, and I can see how Judge
- 13 Sanchez would have gotten there. That's not what this case is
- 14 about. This case is not just about discovery, and it's not
- 15 about what Ms. Barbounis had on her devices. And so I'm not
- 16 interested in appoint ing a third-party neutral in this case.
- But that doesn't mean that there isn't a need for an
- 18 e-discovery vendor. Most cases have a need for an e-discovery
- 19 vendor. Most complicated, complex litigation does these days.
- 20 And, you know, that's why we've gotten to where we are in terms
- 21 of the discovery problems that we have.
- Let me ask, since we're talking about Cornerstone,
- 23 Mr. Walton, does Cozen have access to the Cornerstone platform?
- 24 MR. WALTON: Does Cozen have access to the Junto
- 25 platform? No. That's in the trade secret case.

- But we have our own Relativity environment, which we
- 2 have uploaded some of the material that's on Junto into our
- 3 Relativity.
- 4 THE COURT: And how are you getting it from Junto?
- 5 Are you -- there was some reference in one of your
- 6 emails to Mr. Carson making productions via Dropbox. I don't
- 7 know whether you're doing that. I don't know whether
- 8 Mr. Gold's folks who were involved in the trade secret case are
- 9 pulling stuff down and then loading it back up for you.
- How is that happening?
- MR. WALTON: No. Cornerstone is sending it to us.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay.
- MR. WALTON: The Dropbox came from Seth. Seth -- I'm
- 14 sorry, Mr. Carson.
- Mr. Carson has a Dropbox that he produces discovery
- 16 via Dropbox. And so he produced the text messages in his
- 17 Dropbox. And the way he produces them, he just throws them in
- 18 there, and then we have to go in there and kind of find them.
- And so I believe we -- I shouldn't say we.
- We got the text messages Wednesday before
- 21 Thanksgiving, around midnight, like 68 threads. It took us
- 22 until Tuesday to find them on the Dropbox, the following
- 23 Tuesday. And then we had downloaded those into our Relativity
- 24 environment. And we've been going through those. And we found
- 25 some pretty explosive stuff. But that's 68 threads out of the

- 1 568 that we created the spreadsheet for.
- 2 THE COURT: So when you get things from the Junto
- 3 platform, Mr. Walton, is it coming -- is it stuff -- and I
- 4 don't know who knows the answer to this.
- 5 Is it coming because Cornerstone has deemed that it is
- 6 able to provide it to you subject to the terms of whatever
- 7 confidentiality orders exist in the trade secret case? How is
- 8 it that Cornerstone is able to produce some things to you and I
- 9 quess not other things?
- MR. WALTON: Well, first of all, it's not coming from
- 11 the Junto platform. The Junto platform is like Relativity.
- 12 They -- I just want to make it clear.
- They have images that they've searched and they have
- 14 filtered and everything else.
- THE COURT: So they're sending you some sort of a file
- 16 with an appropriate load file, probably in some sort of
- 17 Concordance back end load file that allows you to load it into
- 18 Relativity. Is that right?
- MR. WALTON: Yes, sir. And so they gave us -- this
- 20 goes back into June and July and everything, where we were
- 21 having -- where we agreed initially that we would use the trade
- 22 secret production to see what's in there first; because like
- 23 you said, it was the most efficient way of doing it.
- And there was a lot of back and forth about us getting
- 25 access to it. We finally got access to it. And just they did

- 1 it kind of as -- I don't want to say as a favor. They didn't
- 2 feel comfortable with it, but they just said, well, okay, we
- 3 can give you what we produced in the trade secret case. And
- 4 that's why we still have problems with the text message
- 5 bubbles, for example, because as per Judge Sanchez's order,
- 6 that's all they were allowed to do.
- 7 So when we say to them, hey, we need to get the full
- 8 text threads, they say, hey, we feel uncomfortable about that
- 9 because Judge Sanchez said we're only allowed to give the
- 10 bubbles.
- Do you know what I mean by bubbles?
- 12 THE COURT: Yes. I get it, as opposed to -- the
- 13 individual single -- whether it's an SMS or MMS message --
- MR. WALTON: Yes.
- 15 THE COURT: -- as opposed to the complete thread.
- MR. WALTON: Yes. And that's just an example, Your
- 17 Honor, of the type of problems that we run into, because then
- 18 they're like, we don't want to do anything that is in violation
- 19 of Judge Sanchez's order.
- Now, they did tell me -- and I disagree with
- 21 Mr. Carson on this -- that Mr. Carson could have hired them and
- 22 we would waive the conflict to the extent that there was any.
- They said the most comfortable way of them dealing
- 24 with it is for Mr. Carson to get his own vendor. They would
- 25 give the images over to the vendor, just the raw images,

- 1 that --
- 2 And just so you know, the images were taken from
- 3 Capsicum in like February, and then those images were ordered
- 4 handed over to Cornerstone. So those images of the phones were
- 5 taken back in February.
- Now, Mr. Carson could either take the phones that he
- 7 currently has and the Google accounts and the social accounts
- 8 and give them to a brand new vendor and start over, or he could
- 9 hire Cornerstone to do a piece of it and then get his own
- 10 vendor.
- But we ran into problems with Cornerstone because
- 12 we're paying for Cornerstone. And, you know --
- 13 THE COURT: Let me be clear. When you say we --
- 14 MR. WALTON: MEF.
- 15 THE COURT: -- is Cozen paying them?
- 16 MEF is paying them.
- 17 MR. WALTER: No, MEF.
- THE COURT: Cozen is not, because Cozen doesn't have a
- 19 relationship with them because they're only in the trade secret
- 20 case?
- MR. WALTON: Not on this case. That's exactly right.
- 22 THE COURT: Okay. I think I understand the dynamic.
- 23 Again, these issues would have been much easier to
- 24 sort through in August and September than they are now given
- 25 where the case is.

- 1 Okay. I want to sort of step back on a couple of
- 2 things and then kind of work my way back forward.
- 3 So let me get a status update on some of the other
- 4 issues that are floating around in the case to make sure I know
- 5 where things stand and what's still out there as an issue.
- 6 There was a letter -- I guess, Mr. Walton, you sent me
- 7 a letter right before Thanksgiving as your weekly update saying
- 8 that the parties were still working on scheduling depositions.
- 9 What depositions are still --
- MR. WALTON: One of the depositions is Marnie Meyer.
- 11 She's the fourth plaintiff that's represented by Ms. Shikunov.
- 12 And we're not involved in that case.
- THE COURT: We being who?
- 14 MR. WALTON: We being Cozen. Clark Hill is involved
- 15 in that case as the defense firm.
- Am I talking loud enough? Can you hear me?
- 17 THE COURT: Yeah, you're fine.
- 18 MR. WALTON: I'm sorry. I'm sorry, Your Honor.
- And that there's a pending motion for DQ, for
- 20 disqualification, against Eric Shikunov in that case. So she
- 21 doesn't feel comfortable producing Marnie Meyer and
- 22 representing her until that motion for DQ is resolved. And
- 23 that's in front of Judge Gallagher. And so I don't know when
- 24 that's going to be resolved, but that's been fully briefed,
- 25 from my understanding. So that's one thing.

- 1 And another thing is we've been trying to serve
- 2 subpoenas on third-party witnesses. We haven't been successful
- 3 doing that. But the most important one is Marnie Meyer.
- And then the other, I've asked Mr. Carson, we need to
- 5 depose Ms. Brady and Ms. Yonchek. They were initial plaintiffs
- 6 that Mr. Carson represented. We've gotten some other
- 7 documents, but we've gotten documents afterwards, and we have
- 8 not taken their depositions in the Barbounis case. I've asked
- 9 Mr. Carson if he still represents them, and I don't believe I
- 10 got a response to that. We've sent a couple emails on that.
- 11 So we're trying to figure out of we need to subpoena them or
- 12 whether we can get them produced through Mr. Carson.
- 13 THE COURT: Let me ask a couple questions.
- 14 All the depositions that were scheduled in the October
- 15 26th order have happened?
- MR. WALTON: Yes, sir.
- 17 THE COURT: Okay. And I know there were some third
- 18 parties who -- at the time who you were still working on.
- 19 Let me look. I think I had asked for a status update
- 20 on the third parties. Let me look and see what that said.
- 21 So I guess my question is for you, Mr. Walton, with
- 22 respect to Ms. Brady and Ms. Yonchek, obviously we've known
- 23 about them for a while. I think I had some discovery issues
- 24 early on with the subpoena to Ms. Yonchek that I dealt with.
- It doesn't look like they were raised as potential

- 1 deponents back in October, so why are they still -- why are you
- 2 dealing with them now?
- 3 MR. WALTON: We're just getting text messages
- 4 involving them from Ms. Barbounis. And we've decided that
- 5 there's some stuff that we didn't have previously that we'd
- 6 like to ask them about.
- 7 THE COURT: So it's based on recent productions?
- 8 MR. WALTON: Yes, sir.
- 9 THE COURT: All right. Well, you guys will have to
- 10 talk, and if you can agree on scheduling the depositions, then
- 11 that's fine. If you can't, I guess you'll put it in front of
- 12 me and I'll decide whether or not what's in there constitutes
- 13 good cause to let you take the depositions or not. You know,
- 14 certainly the timing may be, but the question is what the
- 15 substance is too.
- 16 All right. There has been throughout the case
- 17 discussion about Telegram and Ms. Barbounis's Telegram account.
- I assume based on the last things that I've seen that
- 19 there's been no production of information in Telegram; is that
- 20 correct?
- MR. WALTON: Yes, sir.
- 22 THE COURT: What has been done to try to collect data
- 23 from Telegram, to try to get information out of Ms. Barbounis's
- 24 account?
- Mr. Carson, I'm going to start with you on this one.

- 1 MR. CARSON: Sure. I've had a conversation -- I've
- 2 had several conversations with Cornerstone about this.
- You can't produce -- you can't pull down data from
- 4 Telegram apparently. It's because -- I mean, it's because
- 5 Telegram doesn't use user name and passcodes. The only way to
- 6 get into a Telegram account is through a telephone. So I think
- 7 that there's also -- the same issue exists with Signal and I
- 8 think Wickr too he said, where you can't get that
- 9 information --
- 10 THE COURT: Let me --
- MR. CARSON: -- through a dump.
- 12 THE COURT: -- make sure I understand that.
- 13 You can get it from a telephone.
- MR. CARSON: Right.
- 15 THE COURT: I presume that means the identity it's
- 16 using is either something on the SIM card, like an ISIM number
- 17 or something like that; is that right?
- MR. CARSON: I think what he said was you can get it
- 19 through a telephone, so if there was information from Telegram
- 20 available, it would have been on -- then it would have been
- 21 part of the information that was taken when the phones were
- 22 imaged in February.
- 23 THE COURT: Is Telegram information stored locally on
- 24 the phone, or is it stored on some server somewhere? I assume
- 25 it's the latter, but I don't know.

- 1 MR. CARSON: I think that the only way to get it is
- 2 through imaging a phone is what he said. You can't like -- you
- 3 can't go onto their server somewhere and download it from a
- 4 server.
- 5 THE COURT: No. I know you can't just go onto their
- 6 server.
- 7 But my question is -- I mean, Facebook data, to use
- 8 something that we're all more familiar with, is not stored
- 9 locally on your device.
- 10 MR. CARSON: Right.
- 11 THE COURT: It's stored, you know, in the cloud. But
- 12 if I access it from my device, then I can -- there are settings
- 13 that allow me to pull it down.
- And, you know, I think I've seen that you're pulling
- 15 down things like WhatsApp messages and things like that.
- 16 MR. CARSON: Right.
- 17 THE COURT: Those are all the same thing. None of
- 18 that is stored locally. It's all stored on servers.
- MR. CARSON: That's the difference. With Facebook, my
- 20 client could get on the phone with Cornerstone and give them
- 21 her credentials and get them logged in so they can pull it
- 22 down. Telegram, you can't do it like that.
- 23 THE COURT: Why can't they -- but if she gives them
- 24 access to her phone, either --
- MR. CARSON: That's -- go ahead.

- 1 THE COURT: -- either she or you with the phone open
- 2 can get into her Telegram account. Right?
- 3 MR. CARSON: I think what they said is that they did
- 4 do that, and if there -- and there's a declaration to this
- 5 somewhere, that if there was no Telegram messages produced
- 6 through the production when the phones were imaged, then that
- 7 means there was none on the phone, that they didn't exist.
- 8 THE COURT: Mr. Walton, you're shaking your head.
- 9 What's your understanding of this?
- MR. WALTON: We have downloaded text -- I'm sorry,
- 11 Telegram accounts. There's a desktop client that you can go
- 12 and you can download it, from like a desktop, a laptop.
- 13 THE COURT: And what are the credentials that you use
- 14 to get in then, because --
- MR. WALTON: User name and password. That's my
- 16 understanding. I mean, that's how we got them, and we have --
- 17 THE COURT: And have you provided it -- have you
- 18 talked to Mr. Carson about that and given him access to the
- 19 desktop client?
- MR. WALTON: Well, it has to be the desktop client on
- 21 her computer or a computer that she goes and --
- 22 THE COURT: Right. But I assume the desktop client is
- 23 something you just download somewhere. Right?
- MR. WALTON: I believe so, Your Honor. I mean --
- 25 THE COURT: Have you given him the link or app store

- 1 name -- I don't know if it's an app store in Windows 10 or
- 2 what, but whatever it is, have you given Mr. Carson the
- 3 information he needs to pull down that client?
- 4 MR. WALTON: No, Your Honor. He's -- we haven't had
- 5 many conversations about Telegram. I've just been told by him
- 6 he can't get it, essentially.
- 7 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Carson, I want you to talk
- 8 to Mr. Walton. I want you to look into pulling down that
- 9 client, that desktop client, and see if you can pull down the
- 10 Telegram data. You know, if you want to talk to Cornerstone
- 11 and see if they'll do it for you, you're welcome to. But
- 12 again, they're not working in this case, so it's your
- 13 obligation, and you can figure out how you want to fulfill it.
- 14 Okav?
- MR. WALTON: I actually had a conversation with Rob
- 16 from Cornerstone last night about it, just so I could offer
- 17 like, you know, accurate information today. And they will not
- 18 let me engage them. They just won't.
- 19 THE COURT: They won't let what you, engage them?
- MR. CARSON: Engage them for anything.
- THE COURT: Look, it's your obligation. So, you know,
- 22 whether you do it yourself, whether you engage another vendor
- 23 to help you or what, I want to figure out whether or not -- you
- 24 know, I'm not going to sit here -- I hear what you're all
- 25 saying.

- I haven't used Telegram. I'm not going to start using
- 2 it. And so I'm going to leave it to you guys to figure it out,
- 3 but I'm going to want some clarity as to what the outcome of
- 4 the process is.
- 5 If Ms. Barbounis -- I'd be surprised, Mr. Carson, I
- 6 will just say, if there's not some sort of log-in information.
- 7 Typically, you know, most device -- most messaging services
- 8 have at least a single-factor authentication, where you log in
- 9 with a user name and password.
- It may be that once you've done that once on your
- 11 device, that either the thumbprint or face ID, depending how
- 12 recent the device is, allows to you maintain that log-in.
- And it wouldn't shock me if there's some sort of
- 14 two-factor authentication, where you get, you know, a text
- 15 message to get a code to put in so that you can reconfirm,
- 16 because that's fairly typical in the event of lost credentials
- 17 and things like that as a security device.
- And I just -- I'd be surprised if the answer were once
- 19 anybody gets into your phone, they can have access to your
- 20 Telegram without some sort of -- you know, even if you decided
- 21 to take the risk of storing the log-in. There's got to be a
- 22 log-in somewhere.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor --
- MR. GOLD: Your Honor --
- THE COURT: One at a time. Hold on. One at a time.

- I was talking to Mr. Carson. Let him respond, and
- 2 then I'm happy to hear from you.
- 3 MR. CARSON: My response isn't that important.
- I was going to say, the way I understood it is from
- 5 your phone you tell them what the phone number is and then they
- 6 send you a code and you type that code in and that's how it
- 7 goes into the account.
- 8 THE COURT: Right. Well, that's a form of two-factor
- 9 authentication. And that may be able to be done even not on
- 10 the phone itself. Right?
- I mean if you log on onto a client on the desktop and
- 12 say this is my phone number and you get the text message and
- 13 you punch the code into your desktop client, you may still have
- 14 access to the messaging services.
- And again, it wouldn't surprise me, Mr. Carson, just
- 16 as logic dictates that a lot of these messaging services do
- 17 offer some sort of desktop client so that people can use them
- 18 when they're not remote, particularly if the idea is to use it
- 19 in a business environment. But you'll look into it, and you'll
- 20 update me.
- I'm going to want you guys to update me by next Friday
- 22 on what you find with that.
- You know, let me know. Obviously the ideal report
- 24 that I get from you is we did it and it's done; but if there
- 25 are steps to be done, I want to know what this process is, but

- 1 I want to know what you find as you look into it. Okay?
- 2 MR. CARSON: Your Honor, just for clarity, you're not
- 3 ordering that her entire Telegram account has to be produced,
- 4 just the messages relevant to the case?
- 5 THE COURT: I want relevant messages produced. Right.
- 6 Mr. Gold, go ahead.
- 7 MR. GOLD: Your Honor happens to be correct. You can
- 8 export the Telegram messages from any desktop by using the
- 9 two-factor authorization. It can be done by --if Mr. Carson
- 10 himself has done this in the Delaney Yonchek case. And he has
- 11 accessed those Telegram messages for us back in April, so he
- 12 knows how to get the messages. Somebody has to go on a desktop
- 13 and use that information and access the information.
- 14 THE COURT: I don't need to wade into --
- MR. CARSON: I don't remember.
- 16 THE COURT: -- whether it has happened or not.
- 17 And I don't know what the circumstances were with
- 18 Ms. Yonchek or Ms. Brady -- or Ms. Delaney, rather.
- But you guys will talk. My gut instinct is there's a
- 20 way to do it, but, you know, you need to figure that out.
- Okay. There was an issue when we were on the last
- 22 hearing with some documents that, Mr. Walton, you said had been
- 23 produced with redactions.
- Has that issue been cleared up? Do you know what was
- 25 produced with redactions and what the basis for the redactions

- 1 were, or have they been produced in an unredacted way, or is it
- 2 still outstanding?
- 3 MR. WALTON: I understand the basis of the redactions.
- 4 The redactions have not been resolved.
- 5 The issue involves Cornerstone again, Your Honor, in
- 6 that they were ordered by Judge Sanchez only to produce the
- 7 messages, just the message with the hit.
- 8 So for example, if there was a Twitter DM and there's
- 9 a whole string of Twitter messages, if there's one that has the
- 10 hit, that's all that they were supposed to produce.
- So what they did on the Twitter DMs is they went
- 12 through and they manually redacted. Same with the Instagram
- 13 DMs, they manually redacted everything. That's the way they
- 14 had to do it from --
- 15 I'm sorry if you hear my dogs barking in the
- 16 background.
- 17 THE COURT: If wouldn't be a virtual hearing without
- 18 someone's dogs, Mr. Walton. It's okay.
- 19 MR. CARSON: I have two kids on Zoom school and three
- 20 dogs, so just bear with me.
- 21 So that is -- that's the reason why they have the
- 22 redactions, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Okay. All right. Well, you guys are
- 24 going to have to work that out. And again, this goes to one of
- 25 these issues with the fact that you've got Cornerstone

- 1 laboring, you know, in the trade secret case. And that
- 2 doesn't -- the fact that they're laboring in the trade secret
- 3 case doesn't change the discovery obligations in this case.
- 4 And then we've talked about the text messages, so I
- 5 know where that stands, although I guess, Mr. Carson, you had
- 6 suggested there were some conversations you had with Mr. Walton
- 7 about the text messages.
- 8 Has there been any kind of resolution that I need to
- 9 know about, or is it still an open issue?
- MR. CARSON: I think it's an open issue. The one
- 11 thing I would just suggest is that -- so I did produce 70 text
- 12 threads, which is more text threads by ten times than I think
- 13 I've ever produced in any other case I've ever worked on.
- And I think that -- I only had these 70 text messages,
- 15 because back a year ago when we were trying different things,
- 16 we tried -- we did like a test run to see how we could get --
- 17 how could we produce information. And we tried to like use a
- 18 few keywords, like "MEF."
- And so I had these text threads just in a folder from
- 20 then. I just produced them, I didn't read half of them, in
- 21 accordance with Your Honor's order. Even though I filed a
- 22 motion for reconsideration, which I would argue that the
- 23 production is subject to that motion and Your Honor's ruling on
- 24 that motion, I produced them.
- 25 And I don't know -- like, you know, if there's 578

- 1 text threads that were -- that they want access to, and they
- 2 want access to the entire text thread plus all the metadata and
- 3 attachments, I just think there should be some kind of offer of
- 4 relevance, because I can't imagine that that many text threads
- 5 is relevant to the case. I mean, it just happens to be threads
- 6 that hit on keywords.
- 7 And a lot of -- I mean --
- 8 THE COURT: Okay. I understand what that is,
- 9 Mr. Carson. I'm going to come back to reconsideration, which
- 10 is essentially what you're leading into right now.
- MR. CARSON: Okay.
- 12 THE COURT: Let me just see -- okay.
- The other issue that I haven't I guess touched on,
- 14 Mr. Carson, I know I got updates from you about your review of
- 15 the images you had. And it sounds like you found a workaround
- 16 and --
- 17 MR. CARSON: I did.
- THE COURT: Are you done?
- MR. CARSON: I've -- I'm not done, but I'm like
- 20 95 percent there.
- 21 So I produced today -- they might not have even seen
- 22 them yet. I produced today like 1,350 images that I think are
- 23 relevant that I would not feel comfortable certifying that -- I
- 24 have a certification about producing those, so, like, I
- 25 produced those.

- 1 There were -- I made 13 binders of images from all --
- 2 from the whatever, 100,000 images. And so I got through 12 of
- 3 them. So there's one more binder I didn't get through before
- 4 the hearing today.
- 5 THE COURT: Okay. And then there was an issue,
- 6 Mr. Carson, with media files, not just images but audio
- 7 recordings.
- 8 Where does that stand?
- 9 MR. CARSON: Yeah. They are also -- they are also
- 10 part of that -- the 13 binders.
- I haven't gone through all the images yet. After I
- 12 get through the images, there's a substantial amount of media
- 13 files then. I think --
- I can't imagine at least one of them won't have to be
- 15 produced.
- THE COURT: I'm a little confused when you say
- 17 binders, because --
- 18 MR. CARSON: They're binders I made.
- So what happened is they sent me like, you know, like
- 20 12 folders with like 10,000 to 15,000 messages or images -- or
- 21 files, I should say, not images, files in each one. Some of
- 22 them are media files. Most of them are images.
- THE COURT: So did you have the audio files
- 24 transcribed? What do you mean, they're in the binders?
- MR. CARSON: What I mean is that I haven't even gotten

- 1 to all the images yet. And after I get to the images, I have
- 2 to work through the audio files.
- 3 THE COURT: How many audio files are there?
- 4 MR. CARSON: I'll estimate that there are probably
- 5 500. That's a total estimate.
- 6 THE COURT: And are they typically like two-minute
- 7 conversations or are they 30-minute things?
- 8 MR. CARSON: Some of them are -- most of them, I would
- 9 say, the average is probably like 25 seconds, you know. Some
- 10 of them are a little longer, some are shorter.
- 11 THE COURT: Okay. So they won't take -- I mean, it's
- 12 not a nothing job, but it's not days and days and days. Right?
- MR. CARSON: I think I can get through it maybe today.
- 14 THE COURT: Okay. All right. Mr. Walton?
- MR. WALTON: I think there's more like 3,000, Your
- 16 Honor. And I think --
- MR. CARSON: If there is, it's because I didn't count
- 18 them all.
- MR. WALTON: No. I'm not saying he's lying. I'm
- 20 saying it's more like 3,000.
- And just so you know, the audio messages,
- 22 Ms. Barbounis would have a practice of saying kind of voice
- 23 messages like you and I might use text. Okay?
- THE COURT: Uh-huh.
- MR. CARSON: She would do a lot of it through voice

- 1 messages. So they're not voicemails, but they're voice memos.
- 2 THE COURT: Are they audio texts that she sends as
- 3 SMSs, is that what you mean? Or is she just storing audio
- 4 recordings that either she emails to someone or she texts to
- 5 someone as an attachment?
- 6 MR. CARSON: Yeah. There's a way you can do it in
- 7 WhatsApp and there's a way you can do it in these other
- 8 services she's using.
- 9 They are not -- it's not her dictating to Siri and
- 10 then Siri sends it out as text.
- 11 THE COURT: No. I understand. If you're in your
- 12 iMessage app, for example, and you hit the voice recording
- 13 button and then you record the text and it shows up on my end
- 14 as an audio file.
- MR. WALTON: Yes. Exactly.
- 16 THE COURT: Understood.
- MR. CARSON: Apparently that's how they do it in the
- 18 UK. People instead of texting, they send these voicemails. So
- 19 like I guess she got used to doing it like that. And they're
- 20 there.
- 21 THE COURT: Let me turn to reconsideration, because
- 22 you were getting into it, Mr. Carson.
- 23 And I did read your motion for reconsideration that
- 24 you filed on the 25th.
- I'm going to tell you my thinking on it, Mr. Carson,

- 1 and then I'm going to let you respond.
- I didn't order this production just because I
- 3 concluded that there was relevance, that everything was
- 4 necessarily relevant. But I did reach the conclusion that all
- 5 of these terms -- all of these text strings had some relevance,
- 6 because they had a hit on a search term. And the search terms
- 7 are things that, for whatever reason and whatever the process
- 8 was -- and it may have been in the trade secret case. But
- 9 that's how you guys decided to identify a universe of
- 10 materials. And so if the only thing I've got in front of me
- 11 that identifies a universe of materials that is facially
- 12 potentially relevant, okay, so we start from that point.
- And then the decision to order their production in
- 14 their entirety was frankly done because -- it was a sanction,
- 15 Mr. Carson, because I determined that any objections had been
- 16 waived, that things were not being done to fulfill the
- 17 discovery obligation of actually reviewing the text threads.
- 18 And again, I understand that the production of them took place
- 19 pursuant to whatever restrictions were in place in the trade
- 20 secret case. But as I said, there's a universe of material to
- 21 start with in this case. It may overlap with what's in the
- 22 trade secret case, but the obligations to produce are
- 23 different, and so I ordered their production in their entirety
- 24 for that reason. So it's not just I decided, oh, it's all
- 25 relevant.

- 1 I recognize there were privacy issues that were at
- 2 stake. I know that's a big part of what you are saying in your
- 3 motion. It comes up several times that these are private and,
- 4 you know, maybe you shouldn't be ordering their production. I
- 5 think I addressed that when I ordered the production in the
- 6 first place, because -- and I'm looking back now at the
- 7 transcript from November the 13th. And I'm going to find the
- 8 right page.
- 9 But what I said to you at the time was that I
- 10 recognized that the requirement to produce all of the text
- 11 messages was likely to be overbroad, that it was likely to
- 12 capture material that was, you know, not necessarily relevant.
- I said, page 44 of the transcript, I said, I'm doing
- 14 this because there doesn't seem to be a process to review.
- 15 There doesn't seem to have been a sound e-discovery process in
- 16 place in this case, so I think objections have been waived. If
- 17 there were privilege issues, I assume they were logged.
- And then I said, going forward -- what I said to you
- 19 at the time was you're going to have to have a really good
- 20 reason to explain to me, not just that it's burdensome, not
- 21 just that it's intrusive, but you're going to have to explain
- 22 to me what you did to fulfill your discovery obligations in
- 23 this case through an evaluation of metadata and email threading
- 24 or text threading in order to produce stuff with context.
- 25 And I also said to you that if you were getting into

- 1 stuff that was overbroad, I understood that, I understood the
- 2 concern, and that the way to deal with that was by a protective
- 3 order.
- 4 And I stand by that. It seems to me that the issue --
- 5 concern about privacy is one that can be handled by agreeing to
- 6 a protective order with the defendants, treat it on an
- 7 attorneys' eyes only basis, you know, and put a provision in
- 8 that says -- you know, I don't want to tread on Judge Sanchez's
- 9 case, so whatever is produced in this case can only be used in
- 10 this case. Put that in the protective order. And frankly, you
- 11 know, I'll just --
- 12 I'll short-circuit all of this. Given the order that
- 13 I've entered as to text messages, I do think there's good cause
- 14 under Pansy for that type of protective order to preserve the
- 15 privacy of the information in the first instance. I recognize
- 16 that there's going to be stuff that is out of the scope of this
- 17 case that's going to be produced, and I recognize that there's
- 18 material that's probably private and sensitive.
- But we are where we are in this case, and I need this
- 20 stuff produced. And Mr. Carson, I think to ask you to start
- 21 going through all those text messages is going to slow us down
- 22 enormously. And so what we're going to do is -- and I'm going
- 23 to give you a chance to respond to this.
- But I want the text messages produced. I'm going to
- 25 order that the text messages that are produced pursuant to this

- 1 order be treated on an attorneys' eyes only basis by all
- 2 counsel. They cannot be shown to clients. I am open to
- 3 motions to modify that if there are portions of text messages
- 4 that you think need to be shown to clients. We will tackle
- 5 questions of what to do with material that's used in motions
- 6 later.
- If you're going to file -- if you're going to submit
- 8 any portion of these text messages to -- in connection with a
- 9 motion as a court filing or if you're going to submit them --
- 10 well, I'm not going to deal with trial right now.
- But if you're going to submit them as an attachment to
- 12 any kind of submission to me that would be on the public
- 13 docket, then you have an obligation first to meet and confer to
- 14 try and work out whether it should be filed -- whether or not
- 15 they can -- confidentiality can be waived or whether you think
- 16 confidentiality is even necessary.
- If you don't have an agreement, then whoever is
- 18 submitting the text messages needs to do so by filing a motion
- 19 to keep them under seal. And I will look at them with an eye
- 20 towards the privacy interests that are implicated and decide
- 21 whether to keep them under seal.
- I'm not insensitive to the question, Mr. Carson, about
- 23 the privacy interests here.
- If they go right to the core of the case, then I think
- 25 that may have been put at issue and maybe there's not a privacy

- 1 interest that needs to be preserved. If there's stuff that --
- 2 you know, sometimes you have text messages where there's
- 3 different conversations going on in the same few messages. And
- 4 if there's stuff there that does implicate a privacy interest,
- 5 and you guys want to -- and if it's irrelevant and you want to
- 6 redact it to submit it to me, that's fine.
- If you can't agree on that, put it in with a motion to
- 8 seal, and I'll look at whether we can seal all or part of it.
- 9 Okay?
- But that's my inclination as to how to deal with it
- 11 and to deal with the privacy interests while still -- and
- 12 balance the privacy interests against this and otherwise to
- 13 deny reconsideration and require you to produce the text
- 14 messages. And you're going to have to figure out how to do
- 15 that by working with either Cornerstone or some other vendor.
- But I'm open to hearing you on the issue, Mr. Carson.
- 17 It's your motion, and I want to give you a chance to respond.
- 18 That's not my final ruling. That's just -- in California they
- 19 would call it a tentative ruling or New Jersey they would call
- 20 it a tentative ruling and give you a chance to weigh in. So
- 21 let's treat it that way.
- I can't hear you, Mr. Carson.
- MR. CARSON: I don't -- can you hear me now?
- THE COURT: I can.
- MR. CARSON: I don't know why my computer does that.

- 1 My suggestion would be that I just think -- there's
- 2 568 text threads that were indicated or identified by the
- 3 defendants. And it seems to me that that's like every text
- 4 thread she's ever sent in her entire life. You know, it's like
- 5 she -- we've kind of looked at her phone. We can't find that
- 6 many text threads on her phone, so I don't know where they're
- 7 coming from. But to produce every single text conversation
- 8 with every single person that she's ever known for the last
- 9 whatever amount of years and then produce the entire thread in
- 10 its entirety just seems to be not in any way proportional to
- 11 this case.
- 12 THE COURT: Well, you know, the proportionality
- 13 concerns would have rung far more true to me, Mr. Carson, if
- 14 this issue had been raised earlier.
- We are now, you know, more than a week past the close
- 16 of discovery and I'm still trying to sort this out. And so
- 17 from a proportionality standpoint, I hear what you're saying,
- 18 but I also think that the way to navigate that proportionality
- 19 here is to deal with it with a protective order.
- 20 So in some respects, you benefit. Right? You don't
- 21 haven't to spend the time sorting through them and trying to
- 22 navigate what is and isn't relevant. You're going to shift
- 23 that burden to Mr. Walton and his folks, and they'll figure out
- 24 what it is. And, you know, I don't know if it's 568 separate
- 25 threads. You know, I don't know given the way Cornerstone did

- 1 it that maybe some of these hits are in the same thread. And
- 2 so I don't really know.
- 3 But I think that -- I hear what you're saying about
- 4 sort of weighing privacy and proportionality, but I do think
- 5 there's an expediency to doing it this way. There is some
- 6 facial reason to think that these text threads are relevant,
- 7 and given where we are in the case, I think that the way to do
- 8 it is by letting them look at it subject to the restrictions
- 9 I've imposed. I am going to preserve Ms. Barbounis's
- 10 confidentiality, at least as to the stuff that may be
- 11 overbroad.
- So, you know, I guess I'm -- what I'm going to say,
- 13 what my order will say, Mr. Carson, is that I'm granting in
- 14 part and denying in part the motion for reconsideration. And
- 15 I'll say this in an order today.
- Granted in part in that the production of text
- 17 messages is subject to the confidentiality provisions that I've
- 18 laid out on the record and otherwise denied. Okay?
- 19 Mr. Walton?
- MR. WALTON: Yes. I'm sorry to raise my hand like
- 21 that, Your Honor. I don't know how else to do it.
- THE COURT: It's okay.
- MR. WALTON: May I be heard on your proposed order?
- I have a request.
- THE COURT: Yes.

- 1 MR. CARSON: We gave Mr. Carson a list, actually, of
- 2 about 2,000 threads, and we've cut it to 568 because we figured
- 3 1,500 of them were duplicates the way that Cornerstone ran
- 4 their report. Okay?
- 5 And in the interest of full disclosure, Your Honor, we
- 6 have shown two of those threads to Mr. Roman, and I can tell
- 7 you which ones they are, two of the 68 that we got already.
- 8 And we won't show him any more after this order, but I wanted
- 9 to be up front about that. Okay?
- Number two, Mr. -- I understand putting the burden on
- 11 us, but my request would be that Mr. Carson should have to
- 12 identify the string, which strings he considers to be AEO,
- 13 because clearly most of them shouldn't be AEO because they're
- 14 clearly work related.
- 15 For example -- now, if he wants to do that with the
- 16 ones involving her mom, her husband, treat those as AEO, that's
- 17 fine. But if she's texting people in England, for example, for
- 18 work that she was doing on MRI (ph) and that's all her texts
- 19 for England would be, they shouldn't be treated as AEO.
- 20 Respectfully, Your Honor, they shouldn't be treated as AEO
- 21 initially, because they clearly aren't AEO. They're clearly
- 22 work related.
- 23 She has text messages with the plaintiffs in this case
- 24 or the other claimants. That's something that shouldn't be
- 25 AEO, that we would assert shouldn't initially be AEO, because

- 1 it's going to add a huge burden on us. We've got summary
- 2 judgment coming up on the 18th. We have to file our motion for
- 3 summary judgment in addition to doing all this.
- 4 So I would respectfully request, Your Honor, that as a
- 5 first step Mr. Carson be required to identify which threads he
- 6 wants to treat as AEO. We'll separate those, keep those AEO, I
- 7 won't show those to my client, but that we have non-AEO threads
- 8 too.
- 9 Am I making sense, Your Honor?
- 10 THE COURT: You're making sense, but -- and here's my
- 11 issue with it.
- So I hear what you're saying. The practical reality,
- 13 Mr. Walton, as you know as well as I do is that in most of
- 14 these cases, you have a protective order in place, people push
- 15 out their productions and they wildly overdesignate things as
- 16 AEO.
- 17 MR. WALTON: Yeah.
- 18 THE COURT: And, you know, here I have a situation
- 19 where I'm ordering production of these text messages, you know,
- 20 frankly, out of expediency --
- MR. WALTON: Yes.
- 22 THE COURT: -- because of where we find ourselves.
- 23 And, you know, where we find ourselves, as I've said again and
- 24 again, is not solely a function of what -- the way Mr. Carson
- 25 has conducted discovery here.

- 1 And so I think that, going back to sort of the typical
- 2 example, there's lots of documents in a typical production that
- 3 are designated attorneys' eyes only and they shouldn't be but
- 4 no one cares. Right?
- 5 MR. WALTON: Yes.
- 6 THE COURT: Because they're just not all that
- 7 important in the case.
- 8 MR. WALTON: Yes.
- 9 THE COURT: And I think we're going to have a lot of
- 10 that here too. And so what I think we're going to do in the
- 11 first instance, your client is not going to be the one to look
- 12 at these things. You and your team are.
- You're going to look at them. And these provisions
- 14 are going to look like they would -- my order is going to look
- 15 like a typical protective order would. You're going to have a
- 16 meet and confer obligation to identify for Mr. Carson anything
- 17 that you think shouldn't be AEO.
- 18 Ultimately, if you bring that dispute to me, okay, if
- 19 you guys can't work it out and you bring the dispute to me, the
- 20 burden is going to be on you, Mr. Carson, to justify the
- 21 attorneys' eyes only designation. Okay?
- But in the first instance, there's going to be a
- 23 default that these threads are subject to an attorneys' eyes
- 24 only designation.
- Mr. Walton, you're going to identify the stuff that

- 1 you want to be able to show to your client. You'll go to
- 2 Mr. Carson.
- 3 Mr. Carson, you'll look at it. If you still have a
- 4 good faith basis, you're going to explain that to Mr. Walton.
- 5 And then if you guys can't reach an agreement --
- And again, my expectation is that for a lot of these
- 7 threads, you know, as with any text thread, if you produce the
- 8 whole thing, there's going to be all kinds of chaff that you
- 9 can treat as attorneys' eyes only and then a few messages on a
- 10 few days and times that are the wheat, so to speak, and that
- 11 maybe shouldn't be attorneys' eyes only because it's both core
- 12 to the case and consistent with the kinds of things that
- 13 Ms. Barbounis has already put in the public domain, you know.
- 14 And you'll agree to exclude those from the attorneys' eyes only
- 15 designation. And then you can slice and dice the text chain
- 16 and show your client the relevant portions.
- 17 MR. WALTON: Okay.
- THE COURT: That's how I'm envisioning the process
- 19 playing out. In my order I'll put some provisions that would
- 20 mirror what you would typically see in a protective order along
- 21 these lines in terms of meet and confer obligations so that
- 22 there's some temporal limits to how long you can take back and
- 23 forth before you've got to tee the dispute up before me.
- I will tell you, I mean, you should all know, I'm sure
- 25 you all do know because you've been down this road before, I,

- 1 like everybody else down here, really, really dislike those
- 2 kinds of disputes. You know, my approach to it when I get them
- 3 is not uncommonly to look at this and say, a pox on all your
- 4 houses and try to figure out some solution that then follows up
- 5 with that thought. So do your best to work it out.
- 6 But if you can't, if there's really something there
- 7 where Ms. Barbounis is saying no, this is really sensitive, and
- 8 you're saying, no, we've really got to be able to show it to
- 9 our client -- and again, one thing you can consider as a
- 10 compromise on that issue, because, you know, it's certainly
- 11 something I've done many times and probably you've seen,
- 12 Mr. Walton, and have done as well.
- If it's just a question of showing it, for example, to
- 14 MEF's in-house counsel, you know, that may be a compromise
- 15 where -- because he's an officer of the court too.
- MR. WALTON: Yes, he is.
- 17 THE COURT: And so if he's subject -- if you agree and
- 18 stipulate that he's subject to my order on this, maybe,
- 19 Mr. Carson, you can get over just him seeing it, subject to his
- 20 agreement, you know, to be bound by the protective order.
- 21 Think about that. I'm not telling you you have to do
- 22 that, I'm not putting that in place right now, but maybe that's
- 23 a way you can get around it, because my guess is he's the one
- 24 you're going to be talking about summary judgment theories with
- 25 and things like that, Mr. Walton, but I don't know.

- 1 MR. WALTON: Yes. A quick question, Your Honor, just
- 2 from a mechanical standpoint.
- If we have an objection that we can't work out and we
- 4 need to bring that to your attention, should we do that under
- 5 seal? Should we file that motion under seal, or should we
- 6 draft the motion in a way that doesn't get into the specifics
- 7 of the message?
- 8 THE COURT: Yes. Don't submit the whole thing under
- 9 seal.
- MR. WALTON: In general? In general?
- 11 THE COURT: Describe it in general purposes.
- 12 Probably -- I mean, what I would do -- and what I think is
- 13 normal in those cases is you would submit the document for an
- 14 in camera review.
- MR. WALTON: Yes. If you ordered that.
- 16 THE COURT: I'll do that.
- MR. WALTON: If you read the brief --
- 18 THE COURT: Yes, I'll read the brief. If it's not
- 19 obvious -- I presume if you guys can't work it out, hopefully
- 20 it won't be obvious. If it's obvious and you can't work it
- 21 out, I'll be unhappy.
- But at that point, then I will -- I'll probably order
- 23 an in camera submission. That's what I've done when these have
- 24 cropped up the couple times that I've had them crop up.
- MR. WALTON: So if we have an objection, we will keep

- 1 it general to Your Honor, and then it's up to you to order an
- 2 in camera review if you want to do that?
- 3 THE COURT: Yes, yes.
- 4 MR. WALTON: Okay.
- 5 MR. CARSON: I have a more important question.
- Where are we going to get these texts from?
- 7 THE COURT: That's on you, Mr. Carson. So again, you
- 8 need to figure out -- and you need to go back -- if Cornerstone
- 9 is going to put their foot down and say that because -- I mean,
- 10 I'm not appointing them in this case. Okay?
- So if Cornerstone is going to come back and they're
- 12 going to say -- let me put it this way: I'm not going to
- 13 appoint Cornerstone in this case unless you all put your heads
- 14 together and want to stipulate to having Cornerstone appointed
- 15 as a third-party neutral. If you want to do that, I guess I'm
- 16 open to it, because I'm interested in expediency. Okay? I
- 17 have some concerns about doing it just because, you know, I
- 18 don't love the idea of them being a neutral, and I think I'm
- 19 putting -- I'm not interested in trying to coordinate with
- 20 Judge Sanchez and, you know, have the two of us tap dance
- 21 around each other's orders. But if Cornerstone thinks they can
- 22 comply with both sets of orders and you guys want to stipulate
- 23 to that, then submit me a stipulation and I'll look at it.
- Otherwise, I think the answer is you're going to have
- 25 to get a vendor involved who is going to get the files from

- 1 Concordance -- or from Cornerstone with, you know, the
- 2 appropriate Concordance load files, get them loaded up and make
- 3 them available to you.
- And, you know, it may be that Cornerstone is not
- 5 comfortable producing them. But maybe they're comfortable just
- 6 turning them over to Mr. Walton for him to load into
- 7 Relativity. You know, I don't know. But maybe they don't deem
- 8 that as production. I don't see why it's different than
- 9 producing to a vendor. They may see it as different as
- 10 producing it to a vendor, I don't know. So you guys will have
- 11 to figure that out, Mr. Carson. Okay?
- Mr. Walton?
- MR. WALTON: I have a point of confusion.
- 14 THE COURT: Yes.
- MR. WALTON: Mr. Carson produced 68 text threads to us
- 16 via his Dropbox.
- 17 THE COURT: I thought he said that he had pulled those
- 18 through -- I don't know what method. And you'll have to
- 19 discuss that with him. But he had pulled those before
- 20 Cornerstone and whatever that other entity was got involved.
- MR. WALTON: Capsicum.
- 22 THE COURT: Yes. And I think so he -- it sounds
- 23 like -- is that right, Mr. Carson, you had sort of pulled those
- 24 at the outset?
- MR. CARSON: I may have one or two others that like --

- 1 there was like -- you know, like naked pictures in the threads
- 2 that I didn't -- or things like that. And I just wanted to
- 3 wait for you to rule on the motion for reconsideration before I
- 4 produced them.
- 5 THE COURT: Yep.
- 6 MR. WALTON: But I'm still confused, Your Honor, as to
- 7 where those text messages came from and why that's different
- 8 from the other 500. I'm just confused on that point.
- 9 MR. CARSON: I can explain that.
- 10 So they came from Capsicum, and I got them like months
- 11 and months ago when we did like a test run. And I think we
- 12 used five keywords to try to figure out if there was a way --
- 13 because this is back when there was like 300,000 fields in like
- 14 an Excel spreadsheet. And this is what got Judge Sanchez
- 15 upset.
- So I just -- I was trying to a way to get you
- 17 something in connection with the Court's order.
- 18 MR. WALTON: Okay.
- MR. CARSON: And I found them, and I produced
- 20 everything that I had.
- 21 THE COURT: Maybe that's the simplest way to do this,
- 22 Mr. Carson. And I don't know. I'm going to leave this to you
- 23 guys to work out.
- 24 But if Capsicum still has forensic images of the
- 25 phone, they may be the source to go to quickly to get this done

- 1 and get them back involved, because they may be able to do
- 2 that. If it's just a question of taking an image that they
- 3 have and loading it back into a database, you may be able to do
- 4 that in a couple days. So, you know, consider that as well.
- 5 Okay?
- 6 But I'm not going to tell you who exactly is going to
- 7 make the messages available. You guys need to do that.
- 8 MR. CARSON: Can I redact like the naked pictures and
- 9 things like that?
- 10 THE COURT: Talk to Mr. Walton. I mean, I'm confident
- 11 the answer is yes, but talk to Mr. Walton about that. Okay?
- 12 The only downside to that, Mr. Carson, is then you've got some
- 13 time to spend going through it. Right? And you've got to
- 14 balance that. I want this done, you know, relatively quickly.
- MR. CARSON: Yes. I understand that.
- THE COURT: Okay.
- Mr. Walton, you alluded to this, and I want to get
- 18 some clarity on it. You are anticipating summary judgment
- 19 motions?
- MR. WALTON: Yes. At least partial.
- 21 MR. CARSON: I'm going to file one too on the
- 22 counterclaim.
- THE COURT: On the counterclaim, okay.
- Will yours be partial or fully dispositive in your
- 25 expectation, Mr. Carson?

- 1 MR. CARSON: I've never filed one before, so I don't
- 2 really know how to answer that. Mine is going to be just on
- 3 the counterclaims.
- 4 THE COURT: Right. But to dispose of all the
- 5 counterclaims in their entirety?
- 6 MR. CARSON: Yes, yes.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay. All right.
- 8 MR. GOLD: Your Honor?
- 9 THE COURT: Yes, Mr. Gold.
- MR. GOLD: We're in a little bit of a problem here,
- 11 because Mr. Carson has failed to comply with the Court's orders
- 12 with regard to discovery and turning over information.
- We've been severely impaired in terms of prosecuting
- 14 our counterclaims, so now I find it suspicious that Mr. Walton
- 15 would now file a motion for summary judgment, given the fact --
- 16 THE COURT: I think you mean Mr. Carson.
- 17 MR. GOLD: I mean Mr. Carson now wants to file a
- 18 motion for summary judgment on the counterclaims when he's
- 19 withheld crucial evidence that has left us severely prejudiced
- 20 in terms of information we're seeking with regard to
- 21 prosecuting the counterclaims against his clients.
- 22 So I have a problem with that. And I have the same
- 23 problem with regard to the employment cases.
- He seems to be benefitting from the Court's preclusion
- 25 order that he can't use this information. On the other hand,

- 1 we need this information desperately. The summary judgment
- 2 deadline is fast approaching, and I just think he's gaining
- 3 some unfair advantage by having taken this position where he
- 4 steadfastly violates court orders and deadlines and et cetera.
- 5 So I --
- 6 THE COURT: Mr. Gold, I hear you. I mean, at bottom,
- 7 that was the purpose of the hearing today. It wasn't just a
- 8 status conference. It was a sanctions hearing. I'm looking to
- 9 alleviate prejudice. I'm looking to keep the case moving. I'm
- 10 looking to resolve some of these issues.
- MR. CARSON: Can I respond to what Mr. Gold just said,
- 12 Your Honor, please?
- 13 THE COURT: No. I understand why you want to,
- 14 Mr. Carson, but I'm concerned we're just going to get into a
- 15 back and forth about what did and didn't happen.
- MR. CARSON: No. I just wanted to point out one
- 17 thing, is that defendants have never served discovery requests
- 18 to me in connection with their counterclaims, not one. Not one
- 19 interrogatory, not one document request, so --
- 20 THE COURT: Well, you know --
- MR. CARSON: -- I don't know how I could be in
- 22 violation of not giving information subject to the
- 23 counterclaims when they're never submitted anything.
- MR. GOLD: Your Honor, it's electronic discovery that
- 25 we need. That's the discovery.

- 1 THE COURT: I hear you. I hear you. I understand the
- 2 issue -- the distinction.
- 3 I've covered what I think was sort of teed up by the
- 4 order to show cause and the various issues. I need to take a
- 5 few minutes to just think about what I want to do about them,
- 6 and so we're going to take a recess for -- we'll call it 10
- 7 minutes. So we'll be back at 11:45.
- 8 Here's what I'm going to do. I'm going to leave the
- 9 meeting going and turn off my camera and mute myself. You guys
- 10 can do the same.
- Mr. Gold and Mr. Walton, if you have some desire and
- 12 need to talk to each other now since you're co-defendants, I
- 13 can set up a breakout room, or you can just step away and call
- 14 each other. You tell me.
- MR. WALTON: We can step away and call each other.
- MR. GOLD: We'll call each other.
- 17 THE COURT: Okay. That's fine.
- 18 Let's go off the record now, and we'll take a recess.
- 19 Please be back at 11:45. Okay?
- 20 (Recess at 11:38 a.m. until 11:57 a.m.)
- 21 THE COURT: I've had a chance to think about this.
- I think that the record is pretty clear here that the
- 23 plaintiff and Mr. Carson probably more directly has not
- 24 complied with my orders on discovery in the case and has also
- 25 not been diligent in fulfilling obligations for e-discovery in

- 1 this case in particular, you know, and it's not clear to me
- 2 that he fully understands that or what the obligations are.
- 3 So here's what I want to do. I do think some -- I
- 4 think sanctions are appropriate. I think that the record shows
- 5 that there was at a minimum a reckless disregard if not a
- 6 willful disregard of my orders. And so I do think a contempt
- 7 finding is appropriate well. But, you know, I want to somewhat
- 8 mitigate it, and I'm most interested in moving the case forward
- 9 and getting things done in a way that's both expedient and
- 10 fair.
- So Mr. Carson had said he thought he could be done
- 12 with the production of text messages and audio files in
- 13 relatively short order. That's going to be done by December
- 14 the 8th, which is next Tuesday. And Mr. Carson, you're going
- 15 to certify that it's been done on the docket.
- Plaintiff needs to engage an e-discovery vendor in
- 17 this case. It's clear to me that, I mean, Cornerstone is just
- 18 not able to fulfill that obligation. Again, if you all want to
- 19 stipulate and talk to Cornerstone and then stipulate that
- 20 Cornerstone is going to fulfill that role, I'm willing to have
- 21 that happen, but there needs to be an e-discovery vendor who is
- 22 specifically engaged in this case. And it's plaintiff's
- 23 obligation to do that because it's her discovery burden.
- So I want a report by next Tuesday, December the 8th,
- 25 that plaintiff has engaged an e-discovery vendor. I want to

- 1 know who it is. And want to know the process that's been put
- 2 in place with that e-discovery vendor to obtain the universe of
- 3 potentially responsive documents.
- And so, again, that will come in by way of
- 5 certification on the record on the 8th.
- 6 With respect to some of those issues that the
- 7 e-discovery vendor is going to have to tackle, there's
- 8 Telegram. I want -- Mr. Walton, I want you to provide the
- 9 information about the desktop client to Mr. Carson, preferably
- 10 today, on how to pull down Telegram.
- I want -- this may be somewhat new to the vendor,
- 12 whether it's Capsicum or Cornerstone or someone else, but I
- 13 want a report by next Friday, the 11th, on what the vendor has
- 14 determined or what you, Mr. Carson, have determined is
- 15 accessible from Telegram based on your exploration of that
- 16 desktop client. And then I want a production of accessible,
- 17 responsive Telegram data by December 18th, which is two weeks
- 18 from today.
- And for each of those deadlines, I'm going to get the
- 20 report on the 11th, and then the 18th I want a certification
- 21 from the plaintiff that responsive accessible Telegram data has
- 22 been produced.
- And again, I'm saying responsive, Mr. Carson. It's
- 24 not every message that's in Telegram. But if it's responsive
- 25 and relevant in this case, I want it produced.

- 1 With respect to the documents that were redacted, and
- 2 I gather they were redacted based on whatever confidentiality
- 3 restrictions Cornerstone's laboring under in the trade secret
- 4 case, I want that universe of documents, the unredacted
- 5 versions, to be provided to the new vendor.
- I want a report that that has happened by next Friday.
- 7 And I want -- you know, again, that should be certified,
- 8 that -- by next Friday, the vendor has those materials.
- 9 And then I want a production made by December the 18th
- 10 of that material. I'm not saying there can't be any redactions
- 11 because I don't know what's in those documents. But
- 12 Mr. Carson, if you're going to redact stuff from that
- 13 production, you either need to confer with Mr. Walton and
- 14 Mr. Gold about it and talk about things that you referenced,
- 15 for instance, pictures that may be inappropriate to produce or
- 16 things like that. I don't know if any of that is in these
- 17 Twitter DMs and Instagram DMs and things like that. If there
- 18 is and you talk to them and get an agreement, that's fine. You
- 19 can redact that. Otherwise, if you have a basis, a legal basis
- 20 to redact something, you need to provide them with a log of the
- 21 redaction that you've made as well.
- And I want that production done by the December 18th,
- 23 and I want a certification on the docket.
- I recognize that this may prompt the defendants to
- 25 want to reopen some of the depositions that they've taken based

- 1 on the information that gets produced to them.
- 2 By December the 23rd, I want the defendants to tell
- 3 Mr. Carson if there are any depositions that they propose to
- 4 reopen based on information that has been produced to them.
- 5 If you guys can reach agreement, then that's fine. If
- 6 you can't reach an agreement, then by January the 4th, I want a
- 7 motion from the defendants laying out their good cause from
- 8 what has been produced recently to reopen the depositions. I
- 9 want you guys to work in good faith on that issue. And so I'm
- 10 telling you now that if I get a motion on that issue as to
- 11 whether or not there's good cause to reopen a deposition,
- 12 whoever is the prevailing party, the loser is going to pay for
- 13 that motion. So hopefully you guys can work it out amongst
- 14 yourselves.
- And if a deposition is reopened, if there's good
- 16 cause, and if you guys can't work it out amongst yourselves,
- 17 then I'm going to order the plaintiff to pay for that
- 18 deposition, including the time spent preparing and taking it by
- 19 the defendants.
- MR. CARSON: For what deposition, Your Honor?
- 21 THE COURT: Any deposition that is reopened as a
- 22 result of information that is produced as part of this process,
- 23 Mr. Carson. So if there's information that gets produced now
- 24 that gives the defendants good cause to reopen a deposition,
- 25 then particularly if it comes to me, then I'm going to order

- 1 the plaintiff to pay for the defendants' time preparing for and
- 2 taking that deposition because they're having to do it a second
- 3 time.
- And then as I said, I'm finding that contempt is
- 5 appropriate here. I think that generally with contempt what
- 6 courts do is -- or not generally, but often what they do is
- 7 they impose a monetary penalty that is intended to ensure
- 8 compliance with their orders.
- 9 I'm going to do that here, but I'm going to suspend
- 10 it.
- So I've put these deadlines in place. To the extent
- 12 that these deadlines don't get met, then the contempt sanction
- 13 is going to drop in. And it's going to be \$50 a day until
- 14 there's compliance.
- Mr. Carson, if you run into problems with compliance,
- 16 this is not a situation where it is better to beg for
- 17 forgiveness. This is one where you need to ask for permission.
- 18 So if there's a problem, you can -- it doesn't have to be a
- 19 formal motion. Okay? Letters are fine on this issue. But you
- 20 need to get a letter in advance and tell me what the problem
- 21 you're encountering is so I know and I can modify the contempt
- 22 sanction accordingly. Okay?
- MR. CARSON: Yes.
- 24 THE COURT: I mean, if you're working in good faith
- 25 and I see you're running into legitimate obstacles, I'm willing

- 1 to hear that out. But if you blow past these deadlines, then
- 2 I'm not.
- 3 MR. CARSON: Okay.
- 4 THE COURT: And the last thing, and again, this goes
- 5 to sort of the contempt and sanctions issue. Well, I guess I
- 6 should say we outlined to some extent on the production of text
- 7 messages, that they will be produced subject to confidentiality
- 8 provisions. And I will outline those. We outlined them on the
- 9 record. I'll outline them in a little more detail in my order
- 10 so that you have them consistent with what we've discussed on
- 11 the record here.
- And then the last thing is, Mr. Carson, I'm troubled
- 13 by what seems to be some lack of facility with some of the core
- 14 e-discovery concepts that have given rise to where we find
- 15 ourselves here, and so I'm going to order you to take six hours
- 16 of CLE on e-discovery -- really e-discovery basics. Those
- 17 would be in addition to the CLE hours you need to take to
- 18 fulfill your Pennsylvania Bar requirements. I want you to take
- 19 those 6 hours by March 31st and get me a certification that
- 20 you've done so.
- 21 So that's my order. Or I mean, that's my ruling.
- 22 I'll reduce it to an order hopefully later today.
- The last thing then that that leaves is summary
- 24 judgment. You know, I think it's in my own interest at this
- 25 point to push off the summary judgment deadlines a little bit,

- 1 because the alternative is I'm going to get summary judgment
- 2 motions and then a bunch of supplements. And frankly, I'm
- 3 interested in reducing, not increasing, the amount of paper I
- 4 get.
- 5 So what we're going to do given this schedule -- and
- 6 the other thing, you know all this, there's not going to be a
- 7 trial date any time soon. I mean, I don't know when I'm going
- 8 to get you a trial date in this case, assuming that it gets
- 9 past summary judgment.
- MR. CARSON: Your Honor, will it be 2021 sometime, do
- 11 you think?
- 12 THE COURT: Honestly, Mr. Carson, I don't know. I
- 13 mean, some of that is going to depend -- I don't know when I
- 14 can get you trials, trial dates. And then once I can, as a
- 15 practical matter, you're going to be towards the back of the
- 16 queue. And so I don't know once I can get people trial dates,
- 17 maybe they'll start settling. But if they don't, you know,
- 18 it's going to take me a while to work through that backlog.
- 19 And that includes I've got some cases that I picked up both
- 20 from Delaware and New Jersey that need to be tried in those
- 21 districts.
- And so it could be. It could be 2022. I'm not saying
- 23 it will be. It's certainly not going to be -- there's no way,
- 24 for your planning purposes, it's going to be in the first half
- 25 of 2021. I'd be surprised, very surprised, if it's in the

- 1 third quarter of 2021. So you're probably looking at the back
- 2 half of 2021, the back end of 2021 or 2022 as a practical
- 3 matter.
- 4 MR. CARSON: I'm sorry, Your Honor. Is the reason why
- 5 we're in the back of the queue because criminal trials are
- 6 going to go first?
- 7 THE COURT: No. It's because I'm going to take people
- 8 up in the order in which they were trial ready in all
- 9 likelihood.
- I'm not saying that definitively. For instance, it's
- 11 not inconceivable that I'll slot in some cases that are one-
- 12 and two-day trials ahead of longer ones that might have been
- 13 waiting longer, but I don't have the sense that this is going
- 14 to be a case that's a one- or two-day trial if it goes to
- 15 trial.
- So, you know, the logistics of slotting in a longer
- 17 trial are harder. And even once I start trials, Mr. Carson, I
- 18 don't know that we're going to be just every judge at the
- 19 courthouse willy-nilly able to schedule trials and call a jury.
- 20 Right? We might be having to share space and things like that.
- 21 So all of that is going to have an impact. You know,
- 22 it's not singling you out. It's where we are with everybody
- 23 this day and age, unfortunately.
- MR. CARSON: I understand. Thank you.
- 25 THE COURT: So, you know, I don't want to let this

- 1 slip too far, but there's a fair amount to do. I don't know
- 2 how many depositions there are to be reopened. Hopefully not a
- 3 lot. I mean, hopefully a lot of this stuff that will be
- 4 produced is, you know, part and parcel of what has already been
- 5 explored at depositions. And I don't want the defendants
- 6 gilding the lily here in terms of what needs to reopened. It
- 7 has got to be significant that you found something, not just
- 8 that you found something in order to justify reopening a
- 9 deposition.
- So let's have summary judgment be January 29. Okay?
- 11 And I'll modify the scheduling order. That will give you some
- 12 time to work on the motions based on what you know now. It
- 13 will give you some time to get things scheduled to the extent
- 14 there is stuff that needs to be scheduled. And it will give
- 15 you time to, you know, get back transcripts.
- I don't think these depositions, to the extent they
- 17 get reopened, are going to be real long, and so I think you can
- 18 get the deposition transcripts turned around pretty quickly and
- 19 get them incorporated into whatever you're doing in the way of
- 20 summary judgment.
- 21 All right. I think that covers everything.
- Mr. Carson, anything else you need to bring up?
- MR. CARSON: Yes. Just I don't think we addressed --
- 24 at the last hearing you imposed -- you said that I had to pay
- 25 for the cost of their motion.

- 1 THE COURT: Yes.
- 2 MR. CARSON: And I think after we look at the record,
- 3 it's pretty clear that they filed a motion inappropriately.
- 4 Their motion was based on discovery that both parties
- 5 got at the exact same time and that at no time did anyone
- 6 ever -- and I filed a motion for reconsideration on this issue.
- 7 No one ever contacted me to even tell me -- I found
- 8 out about the deficiencies in their motion for sanctions. They
- 9 didn't --
- 10 THE COURT: I think -- Mr. Carson, I think a lot of
- 11 what was there and the reason I entered the order that I did
- 12 was because I concluded that you had not been compliant with
- 13 your discovery obligations. I think the record today is
- 14 consistent with that. So I'm going to deny that aspect of the
- 15 reconsideration as well.
- MR. CARSON: All right.
- 17 THE COURT: Okay?
- 18 MR. CARSON: When we look at it, there wasn't even
- 19 enough time between the time that we got the discovery and the
- 20 time they filed their motion, there wasn't even enough time in
- 21 hours to even complete the -- the --
- THE COURT: But Mr. Carson, again, this is one of
- 23 those things where you can't beg forgiveness, you've got to ask
- 24 permission. And I concluded at the last hearing that you had
- 25 violated both discovery obligations and my orders. I think the

- 1 record still bears that out, so I'm not going to reconsider.
- 2 MR. CARSON: Okay.
- 3 THE COURT: Okay?
- 4 Anything else?
- 5 MR. CARSON: Oh.
- 6 THE COURT: Yes?
- 7 MR. CARSON: Your Honor, I did write a couple things
- 8 down to ask you about.
- 9 Can you put as part of the order that defendants have
- 10 to identify -- I don't even know what redactions they're
- 11 talking about. Can they identify the documents that they're
- 12 talking about that they want unredacted?
- 13 THE COURT: I think they have, but that's fine.
- 14 Mr. Walton, tell Mr. Carson --
- MR. WALTON: We can do that.
- 16 THE COURT: -- what the Bates range is. Give him the
- 17 Bates range. Okay.
- MR. CARSON: And then the other thing is, is I think
- 19 the only outstanding issue after today are the text messages.
- If I can figure out a way to work with Cornerstone to
- 21 get those produced, can I attempt that?
- 22 THE COURT: I don't think it's the only outstanding
- 23 issue.
- 24 Again, as I said, if you all can agree to use
- 25 Cornerstone for that, that's fine. There's the pictures -- did

- 1 I not say -- mention the text messages when I went through
- 2 this? The text messages need to be -- I'm sorry. The images
- 3 and audio files need to be done by next Tuesday.
- 4 MR. CARSON: Right.
- 5 THE COURT: The text messages, I need a report from --
- 6 if you can do it with Cornerstone, great. I want a report as
- 7 part of what you're getting me from the vendor, if you get a
- 8 new vendor involved, by December the 11th. That should include
- 9 the report on text messages as well.
- And then I want the text messages produced by the 18th
- 11 as well. And that should get certified.
- Mr. Carson, if you can work with Cornerstone to
- 13 obviate the need to get a new vendor in place for any of these
- 14 issues and you can get the production out -- my ultimate goal
- 15 is not a full employment act for e-discovery vendors. It is to
- 16 get the relevant materials out to the defendants.
- And so if you can find a way to work with Cornerstone
- 18 to get that done either by engaging them directly in this case,
- 19 because that may have some cost savings, or by just persuading
- 20 them to do it, it's fine. Okay? And then that should be part
- 21 of the certification I get on Tuesday then, on the 8th, because
- 22 the order is going to require you to certify that you've gotten
- 23 me a vendor and what the process is to obtain and produce the
- 24 documents.
- If the certification is I've spoken with Cornerstone

- 1 and either engaged them or they've agreed to produce all this
- 2 stuff, that's fine with me. Okay?
- 3 MR. CARSON: Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.
- 4 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Walton, anything else?
- 5 MR. WALTON: Yes, Your Honor. I have to ask this just
- 6 for the benefit of my client.
- 7 Are we -- is the Court planning to order our costs and
- 8 fees for our participation in the events including -- you know,
- 9 subsequent to your prior order granting the fees including this
- 10 hearing?
- 11 THE COURT: No.
- MR. WALTON: Okay.
- 13 THE COURT: I'm not. Okay? They were different
- 14 issues. This was -- as I said, this was -- I mean, obviously
- 15 we got into a lot of discovery, but it was also motivated by
- 16 the issue of compliance with the request for daily updates.
- 17 And I don't think that was quite as much of an issue for your
- 18 client as it was for me just from sort of a juris prudential,
- 19 sort of court administration standpoint, so no.
- MR. WALTON: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Yep.
- Mr. Gold, anything else?
- MR. GOLD: No, Your Honor. Thank you very much.
- 24 Appreciate it.
- THE COURT: Thanks everybody.

```
1
             We're going to stand adjourned, and I'll look for your
 2
    updates.
 3
             Thank you. Have a good weekend.
 4
             (Proceedings concluded at 12:20 p.m.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
             I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript
 9
    from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.
10
    Ann Marie Mitchell
11
12
    Ann Marie Mitchell, CRR, RDR, RMR
    Official Court Reporter
13
    Date: 11th day of December, 2020
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

\$30,000 [1] - 28:23 **\$50** [1] - 76:13 **1** [1] - 6:9 **1,350** [1] - 48:22 **1,500** [1] - 59:3 **10** [2] - 42:1, 71:6 **10,000** [1] - 49:20 **100,000** [1] - 49:2 10:04 [1] - 3:1 11:38 [1] - 71:20 **11:45** [2] - 71:7, 71:19 **11:57** [1] - 71:20 11th [4] - 73:13, 73:20, 83:8, 85:13 **12** [2] - 49:2, 49:20 12:20 [1] - 85:4 **13**[3] - 13:3, 49:1, 49:10 **13th** [14] - 4:25, 5:6, 6:1, 6:12. 7:9. 7:10. 13:3. 16:8. 17:9, 17:10, 17:17, 19:10, 25:1, 53:7 **15**[1] - 18:11 **15,000** [1] - 49:20 **17th** [3] - 3:10, 17:9, 17:11 18th [7] - 16:14, 60:2, 73:17, 73:20, 74:9, 74:22, 83:10 **2**[1] - 6:9 2,000 [1] - 59:2 2020 [1] - 85:13 **2021** [5] - 78:10, 78:25, 79:1, 79:2 2022 [2] - 78:22, 79:2 20th [1] - 3:14 23rd [1] - 75:2 **25** [1] - 50:9 25th [3] - 8:20, 11:1, 51:24 26th [1] - 37:15 29 [1] - 80:10 3[1] - 6:10 3,000 [2] - 50:15, 50:20 30-minute [1] - 50:7 300,000 [1] - 67:13 31st [1] - 77:19 44 [1] - 53:13 4th [1] - 75:6 **500** [2] - 50:5, 67:8 **567** [1] - 27:22 **568** [5] - 28:2, 33:1, 57:2, 57:24, 59:2 **578** [2] - 20:1, 47:25 6 [1] - 77:19 **68** [4] - 32:21, 32:25, 59:7, 66:15 70 [2] - 47:11, 47:14 **74** [1] - 6:4 77 [1] - 3:12 80 [1] - 4:17 8th [4] - 72:14, 72:24, 73:5, 83:21 alert [1] - 14:3

95 [1] - 48:20 a.m [3] - 3:1, 71:20 able [10] - 17:23, 33:6, 33:8, 44:9, 62:1, 63:8, 68:1, 68:3, 72:18, 79:19 above-entitled [1] - 85:9 absolutely [2] - 7:25, 14:17 absolve [2] - 23:22, 31:2 access [15] - 23:3, 26:18, 27:16, 31:23, 31:24, 33:25, 40:12, 40:24, 41:18, 43:19, 44:14, 45:13, 48:1, 48:2 accessed [1] - 45:11 accessible [3] - 73:15, 73:16, 73:21 accessing [1] - 27:22 accordance [1] - 47:21 accordingly [1] - 76:22 account [9] - 13:21, 14:1, 28:10, 38:17, 38:24, 39:6, 41:2, 44:7, 45:3 accounts [7] - 28:6, 28:7, 28:9, 35:7, 41:11 accurate [1] - 42:17 act [1] - 83:15 action [1] - 29:20 actively [1] - 12:25 actual [1] - 15:23 add [1] - 60:1 addition [2] - 60:3, 77:17 address [7] - 3:3, 5:6, 5:21, 6:1, 6:7, 12:23 addressed [2] - 53:5, 80:23 addresses [1] - 5:23 adjourned [1] - 85:1 administration [1] - 84:19 advance [1] - 76:20 advantage [1] - 70:3 **AEO** [13] - 59:12, 59:13, 59:16, 59:19, 59:20, 59:21, 59:25, 60:6, 60:7, 60:16, 61:17 afford [1] - 21:13 afterwards [1] - 37:7 age [2] - 12:24, 79:23 ago [2] - 47:15, 67:11 agree [6] - 28:18, 38:10, 56:7, 62:14, 63:17, 82:24 agreed [10] - 18:14, 23:11, 23:12, 23:17, 24:1, 25:18, 25:23, 25:25, 33:21, 84:1 agreeing [1] - 54:5 agreement [11] - 21:13, 22:1, 25:19, 25:25, 28:16, 55:17, 62:5, 63:20, 74:18, 75:5, agreements [1] - 23:20 ahead [4] - 18:1, 40:25, 45:6, 79:12

alleviate [1] - 70:9 allow [4] - 24:10, 29:23, 31:5, 40:13 allowed [2] - 34:6, 34:9 allows [2] - 33:17, 43:12 alluded [1] - 68:17 alone [2] - 4:4, 17:15 alternative[1] - 78:1 amount [5] - 13:24, 49:12, 57:9, 78:3, 80:1 ample [1] - 30:23 Ann [1] - 85:12 answer [5] - 33:4, 43:18, 65:24, 68:11, 69:2 anticipating [1] - 68:18 app [4] - 26:15, 41:25, 42:1, 51:12 appoint [2] - 31:16, 65:13 appointed [1] - 65:14 appointing [1] - 65:10 appreciate [1] - 84:24 approach [1] - 63:2 approaching [1] - 70:2 appropriate [6] - 3:8, 33:16, 66:2, 72:4, 72:7, 76:5 April [1] - 45:11 argue [1] - 47:22 argument [1] - 10:4 arrangements [1] - 26:6 aside [2] - 12:19, 19:9 aspect [1] - 81:14 assert [1] - 59:25 assume [5] - 21:23, 38:18, 39:24, 41:22, 53:17 assuming [1] - 78:8 attachment [2] - 51:5, 55:11 attachments [7] - 13:8, 13:16, 16:12, 16:13, 19:15, 23:8, 48:3 attempt [1] - 82:21 attention [3] - 7:7, 9:4, 64:4 attorney [1] - 5:4 attorneys [1] - 22:23 attorneys' [8] - 54:7, 55:1, 61:3, 61:21, 61:23, 62:9, 62:11, 62:14 audio [10] - 49:6, 49:23, 50:2, 50:3, 50:21, 51:2, 51:3, 51:14, 72:12, 83:3 August [1] - 35:24 authentication [3] - 43:8, 43:14, 44:9 authorization [2] - 18:18, 45:9 authorize [1] - 16:17 available [5] - 18:2, 18:6, 39:20, 66:3, 68:7 average [1] - 50:9 award [1] - 5:4

background [1] - 46:16 backlog [1] - 78:18 balance [2] - 56:12, 68:14 Bar [1] - 77:18 Barbounis [9] - 27:16, 27:21, 31:15, 37:8, 38:4, 43:5, 50:22, 62:13, 63:7 Barbounis's [4] - 28:4, 38:17, 38:23, 58:9 barking [1] - 46:15 based [12] - 4:6, 25:5, 25:8, 28:7, 38:7, 38:18, 73:15, 74:2, 74:25, 75:4, 80:12, 81:4 basic [1] - 15:22 basics [1] - 77:16 basis [9] - 13:22, 13:25, 45:25, 46:3, 54:7, 55:1, 62:4, 74:19 Bates [2] - 82:16, 82:17 bear [1] - 46:20 bears [1] - 82:1 **befuddled** [1] - 7:16 beg [2] - 76:16, 81:23 behind [3] - 3:25, 4:12, 11:25 belong [1] - 27:20 belongs [1] - 28:12 benefit [2] - 57:20, 84:6 benefitting [1] - 69:24 best [1] - 63:5 better [1] - 76:16 between [3] - 11:24, 22:3, 81:19 beyond [1] - 13:2 big [2] - 3:6, 53:2 **bigger** [3] - 10:6, 10:7, 11:12 bills [1] - 21:12 binder [1] - 49:3 binders [5] - 49:1, 49:10, 49:17, 49:18, 49:24 bit [2] - 69:10, 77:25 blaming [1] - 25:19 blow [1] - 77:1 **bottom** [1] - 70:6 bound [2] - 26:1, 63:20 Brady [3] - 37:5, 37:22, 45:18 brand [1] - 35:8 break [1] - 7:12 breakout [1] - 71:13 brief [2] - 64:17, 64:18 briefed [1] - 36:24 bring [4] - 61:18, 61:19, 64:4, 80:22 broad [1] - 23:16 brought [1] - 22:13 **bubbles** [3] - 34:5, 34:10, 34:11 bunch [1] - 78:2 burden [5] - 57:23, 59:10,

60:1, 61:20, 72:23 burdensome [1] - 53:20 business [1] - 44:19 **button** [1] - 51:13 $\textbf{calendar} \ {\tiny [3]} \ \textbf{-} \ 14{:}21, \ 14{:}22,$ 15:3 California [1] - 56:18 camera [4] - 64:14, 64:23, 65:2, 71:9 cannot [2] - 10:13, 55:2 Capsicum [6] - 27:12, 35:3, 66:21, 67:10, 67:24, 73:12 capture [1] - 53:12 card [1] - 39:16 care [3] - 10:22, 24:12, 25:13 cares [1] - 61:4 **Carson** [97] - 3:9, 3:19, 4:10, 5:6, 5:24, 7:8, 8:12, 9:16, 10:4, 12:12, 13:6, 13:21, 19:10, 20:23, 21:18, 22:24, 23:3, 23:7, 23:19, 24:13, 25:23, 26:20, 30:8, 30:12, 31:3, 32:6, 32:14, 32:15, 34:21, 34:24, 35:6, 37:4, 37:6, 37:9, 37:12, 38:25, 41:18, 42:2, 42:7, 43:5, 44:1, 44:15, 45:9, 47:5, 48:9, 48:14, 49:6, 51:22, 51:25, 52:15, 54:20, 55:22, 56:16, 56:22, 57:13, 58:13, 59:1, 59:11, 60:5, 60:24, 61:16, 61:20, 62:2, 62:3, 63:19, 65:7, 66:11, 66:15, 66:23, 67:22, 68:12, 68:25, 69:11, 69:16, 69:17, 70:14, 71:23, 72:11, 72:14, 73:9, 73:14, 73:23, 74:12, 75:3, 75:23, 76:15, 77:12, 78:12, 79:17, 80:22, 81:10, 81:22, 82:14, **CARSON** [120] - 3:20, 3:22, 5:20, 6:20, 6:23, 6:25, 7:24, 8:22, 9:18, 11:15, 11:18, 12:15. 14:6. 14:14. 15:8. 15:13, 16:16, 16:20, 16:24, 17:3, 17:16, 18:3, 18:7, 18:11, 18:14, 19:2, 19:5, 19:19, 19:22, 20:1, 20:5, 21:4, 21:8, 21:11, 21:19, 21:25, 22:3, 22:6, 23:11, 23:21, 23:24, 24:15, 24:21, 24:25, 25:18, 26:10, 26:22, 26:25, 27:2, 27:6, 27:11, 27:22, 28:5, 28:11, 28:23, 29:17, 29:22, 30:2, 30:5, 39:1, 39:11, 39:14, 39:18, 40:1, 40:10, 40:16, 40:19, 40:25, 41:3, 42:20, 43:23, 44:3, 45:2, 45:15, 46:19,

47:10, 48:11, 48:17, 48:19,

49:9, 49:18, 49:25, 50:4, 50:8, 50:13, 50:17, 50:25, 51:6, 51:17, 56:23, 56:25, 59:1, 65:5, 66:25, 67:9, 67:19, 68:8, 68:15, 68:21, 69:1, 69:6, 70:11, 70:16, 70:21, 75:20, 76:23, 77:3, 78:10, 79:4, 79:24, 80:23, 81:2, 81:16, 81:18, 82:2, 82:5, 82:7, 82:18, 83:4, 84:3 Carson's [1] - 22:17 case [115] - 3:5, 3:11, 4:4, 4:8, 10:7, 11:21, 12:3, 12:7, 12:24, 13:21, 15:3, 17:4, 20:23, 21:3, 21:7, 21:10, 21:17, 21:22, 22:7, 22:10, 22:14, 22:16, 22:24, 22:25, 23:2, 23:4, 23:13, 23:16, 23:18, 23:23, 24:2, 24:4, 25:11, 25:16, 25:17, 25:24, 26:1, 26:2, 26:4, 26:5, 27:18, 28:24, 29:6, 29:7, 29:13, 29:15, 29:21, 30:1, 30:13, 30:14, 31:3, 31:5, 31:6, 31:7, 31:8, 31:11, 31:12, 31:13, 31:14, 31:16, 31:25, 32:8, 33:7, 34:3, 35:20, 35:21, 35:25, 36:4, 36:12, 36:15, 36:20, 37:8, 38:16, 42:12, 45:4, 45:10, 47:1, 47:3, 47:13, 48:5, 52:8, 52:20, 52:21, 52:22, 53:16, 53:23, 54:9, 54:10, 54:17, 54:19, 55:24, 57:11, 58:7, 59:23, 61:7, 62:12, 65:10, 65:13, 70:9, 71:24, 72:1, 72:8, 72:17, 72:22, 73:25, 74:4, 78:8, 79:14, 83:18 cases [6] - 31:18, 60:14, 64:13, 69:23, 78:19, 79:11 cell [2] - 26:22, 26:24 certainly [3] - 38:14, 63:10, 78:23 certification [7] - 48:24, 73:5, 73:20, 74:23, 77:19, 83:21, 83:25 certified [2] - 74:7, 83:11 certify [3] - 72:15, 83:22, 85:8 certifying [1] - 48:23 cetera [1] - 70:4 chaff [1] - 62:8 chain [1] - 62:15 challenge [1] - 10:22 Chambers [5] - 6:7, 6:8, 13:11, 13:20, 14:1 **chance** [5] - 9:16, 54:23, 56:17, 56:20, 71:21 **change** [1] - 47:3

child [2] - 24:10, 24:18

chose [3] - 7:4, 7:6, 7:19 circuit [1] - 54:12 circumstances [1] - 45:17 Civil [1] - 24:9 **claimants** [1] - 59:24 clarity [3] - 43:3, 45:2, 68:18 Clark [1] - 36:14 CLE [2] - 77:16, 77:17 clear [9] - 4:6, 4:22, 15:17, 33:12, 35:13, 71:22, 72:1, 72:17, 81:3 cleared [1] - 45:24 **clearly** [4] - 59:13, 59:14, 59:21 **client** [20] - 40:20, 41:11, 41:19, 41:20, 41:22, 42:3, 42:9, 44:11, 44:13, 44:17, 60:7, 61:11, 62:1, 62:16, 63:9, 73:9, 73:16, 84:6, 84:18 clients [3] - 55:2, 55:4, 69:21 **close** [2] - 30:10, 57:15 cloud [2] - 28:7, 40:11 cloud-based [1] - 28:7 **co**[1] - 71:12 co-defendants [1] - 71:12 **code** [4] - 43:15, 44:6, 44:13 colleagues [1] - 17:13 collect [1] - 38:22 collection [1] - 28:21 comfortable [7] - 7:2, 34:2, 34:23, 36:21, 48:23, 66:5 coming [7] - 8:16, 13:1, 33:3, 33:5, 33:10, 57:7, 60:2 communication [2] - 20:10, 26.14 communications [1] - 20:12 company [1] - 25:2 complete [2] - 34:15, 81:21 complex [1] - 31:19 compliance [8] - 3:6, 10:12, 10:17, 11:8, 76:8, 76:14, 76:15, 84:16 compliant [1] - 81:12 **complicated** [1] - 31:19 complied [3] - 5:11, 10:10, 71:24 comply [17] - 4:14, 5:17, 6:21, 6:24, 7:4, 7:7, 9:1, 9:8, 9:9, 10:15, 11:13, 15:12, 25:2, 31:3, 65:22, 69:11 **complying** [5] - 5:19, 7:23, 8:8, 8:11, 9:5 compromise [2] - 63:10, 63:14 computer [3] - 41:21, 56:25 concepts [1] - 77:14 concern [3] - 10:5, 54:2, 54:5

concerned [1] - 70:14

concerning [1] - 3:10 concerns [2] - 57:13, 65:17 concluded [4] - 52:3, 81:12, 81:24, 85:4 conclusion [1] - 52:4 Concordance [3] - 33:17, 66:1, 66:2 conduct [1] - 9:17 conducted [1] - 60:25 confer [4] - 55:13, 61:16, 62:21, 74:13 conference [2] - 17:19, 70:8 confident [1] - 68:10 confidentiality [8] - 26:1, 33:7, 55:15, 55:16, 58:10, 58:17, 74:2, 77:7 conflict [1] - 34:22 confused [3] - 49:16, 67:6, 67:8 confusion [1] - 66:13 connection [3] - 55:8, 67:17, 70:18 consciously [2] - 7:19, 8:1 consider [2] - 63:9, 68:4 considering [2] - 3:11, 3:13 considers [1] - 59:12 consistent [4] - 9:14, 62:12, 77:10, 81:14 **constitutes** [1] - 38:12 constructive [2] - 15:24, consuming [1] - 28:21 contacted [2] - 16:24, 81:7 contempt [6] - 72:6, 76:4, 76:5, 76:12, 76:21, 77:5 context [1] - 53:24 continued [2] - 6:16, 18:12 contractual [1] - 22:4 conversation [8] - 15:6, 18:8, 18:17, 19:6, 19:9, 39:1, 42:15, 57:7 conversations [9] - 18:6, 19:21, 20:9, 20:11, 39:2, 42:5, 47:6, 50:7, 56:3 coordinate [1] - 65:19 copy [1] - 13:21 core [3] - 55:24, 62:11, 77:13 Cornerstone [91] - 11:6, 13:6, 16:17, 16:19, 16:22, 17:9, 17:15, 17:18, 17:21, 18:10, 18:17, 19:15, 20:6, 20:7, 20:23, 20:24, 21:2, 21:6, 21:9, 21:12, 21:15, 21:16, 21:24, 22:1, 22:8, 22:11, 22:12, 22:15, 22:16, 22:17, 22:19, 22:21, 22:25, 23:8, 24:1, 24:5, 25:3, 25:5, 25:9, 25:11, 25:12, 25:24, 26:3, 26:4, 26:20, 27:4, 27:18, 28:3, 28:12, 28:15,

28:16, 29:1, 29:12, 30:6, 31:4, 31:22, 31:23, 32:11, 33:5, 33:8, 35:4, 35:9, 35:11, 35:12, 39:2, 40:20, 42:10, 42:16, 46:5, 46:25, 56:15, 57:25, 59:3, 65:8, 65:11, 65:13, 65:14, 65:21, 66:1, 66:4, 66:20, 72:17, 72:19, 72:20, 73:12, 82:20, 82:25, 83:6, 83:12, 83:17, 83:25 Cornerstone's [3] - 21:19, 23:9, 74:3 correct [3] - 38:20, 45:7, 85:8 cost [3] - 26:7, 80:25, 83:19 costs [1] - 84:7 counsel [3] - 13:21, 55:2, 63:14 Counsel [1] - 6:6 count [1] - 50:17 counterclaim [2] - 68:22, 68:23 counterclaims [7] - 69:3, 69:5, 69:14, 69:18, 69:21, 70:18, 70:23 couple [7] - 4:21, 36:1, 37:10, 37:13, 64:24, 68:4, 82:7 **course** [1] - 3:4 court [6] - 9:6, 11:11, 15:21, 55:9, 70:4, 84:19 Court [2] - 3:1, 85:12 Court's [3] - 67:17, 69:11, 69:24 courthouse [1] - 79:19 courts [4] - 4:12, 4:13, 12:23, 76:6 covered [1] - 71:3 covering [1] - 21:11 covers [1] - 80:21 Cozen [7] - 17:12, 31:23, 31:24, 35:15, 35:18, 36:14 create [1] - 23:20 created [1] - 33:1 credentials [3] - 40:21, 41:13, 43:16 criminal [1] - 79:5 crop [1] - 64:24 cropped [1] - 64:24 CRR [1] - 85:12 crucial [1] - 69:19 cut [1] - 59:2 cutoff [3] - 8:16, 8:21, 13:1 daily [15] - 5:7, 6:6, 6:19, 6:23, 7:15, 10:21, 11:3, 11:4, 12:18, 13:9, 13:22, 13:25, 14:9, 14:10, 84:16 dance [1] - 65:20 data [13] - 20:24, 22:20, 24:7, 26:21, 27:17, 28:3, 28:4,

38:22, 39:3, 40:7, 42:10, 73:17, 73:21 database [1] - 68:3 date [4] - 6:13, 8:4, 78:7, 78:8 Date [1] - 85:13 dates [2] - 78:14, 78:16 Dave [5] - 18:15, 18:19, 20:10 days [7] - 30:20, 31:19, 50:12, 62:10, 68:4 deadline [2] - 4:2, 70:2 deadlines [9] - 4:13, 4:14, 19:11, 70:4, 73:19, 76:11, 76:12, 77:1, 77:25 deal [6] - 30:9, 54:2, 55:10, 56:10, 56:11, 57:19 dealing [3] - 30:10, 34:23, 38.2 deals [2] - 5:3, 5:4 dealt [1] - 37:24 December [8] - 72:13, 72:24, 73:17, 74:9, 74:22, 75:2, 83:8, 85:13 decide [3] - 15:25, 38:12, 55:20 decided [5] - 18:20, 38:4, 43:20, 52:9, 52:24 decision [1] - 52:13 declaration [1] - 41:4 deem [1] - 66:7 deemed [1] - 33:5 default [1] - 61:23 defendants [19] - 4:16, 9:20, 10:6, 18:25, 21:8, 24:7, 26:8, 54:6, 57:3, 70:17, 71:12, 74:24, 75:2, 75:7, 75:19, 75:24, 80:5, 82:9, 83:16 defendants' [3] - 16:5, 30:15, defense [2] - 17:14, 36:15 deficiencies [1] - 81:8 definitively [1] - 79:10 Delaney [2] - 45:10, 45:18 **Delaware** [1] - 78:20 delay [1] - 30:16 delays [1] - 30:13 demonstrate [1] - 8:4 denied [1] - 58:18 deny [2] - 56:13, 81:14 denying [1] - 58:14 deponents [1] - 38:1 depose [1] - 37:5 deposition [11] - 17:11, 18:3, 75:11, 75:15, 75:18, 75:20, 75:21, 75:24, 76:2, 80:9, 80:18 depositions [14] - 3:25, 36:8,

36:9, 36:10, 37:8, 37:14,

38:10, 38:13, 74:25, 75:3,

75:8, 80:2, 80:5, 80:16 deprived [1] - 11:10 describe [2] - 7:20, 64:11 designated [1] - 61:3 designation [3] - 61:21, 61:24, 62:15 desire [1] - 71:11 desktop [13] - 41:11, 41:12, 41:19, 41:20, 41:22, 42:9, 44:11, 44:13, 44:17, 45:8, 45:12, 73:9, 73:16 desperately [1] - 70:1 destroyed [1] - 27:14 detail [1] - 77:9 determined [3] - 52:15, 73:14 device [6] - 40:9, 40:12, 43:7, 43:11, 43:12, 43:17 devices [1] - 31:15 diagram [1] - 29:8 dialogue [1] - 14:4 dice [1] - 62:15 dictates [1] - 44:16 dictating [1] - 51:9 difference [1] - 40:19 different [9] - 12:1, 26:16, 47:15, 52:23, 56:3, 66:8, 66:9, 67:7, 84:13 differently [2] - 26:5, 31:12 diligent [1] - 71:25 diligently [1] - 8:1 direct [3] - 14:4, 20:10, 31:6 directed [4] - 4:23, 5:1, 5:2, directly [2] - 71:23, 83:18 directs [1] - 24:4 disagree [3] - 30:12, 31:1, 34:20 disclose [1] - 22:20 **disclosure** [1] - 59:5 discoverable [1] - 22:23 discovery [50] - 4:7, 8:16, 8:18, 8:20, 8:24, 13:1, 21:20, 21:21, 22:13, 23:12, 23:23, 25:8. 25:15. 25:16. 30:10. 30:20, 31:3, 31:14, 31:18, 31:21, 32:15, 37:23, 47:3, 52:17, 53:15, 53:22, 57:16, 60:25, 69:12, 70:17, 70:24, 70:25, 71:24, 71:25, 72:16, 72:21, 72:23, 72:25, 73:2, 73:7, 77:14, 77:16, 81:4, 81:13, 81:19, 81:25, 83:15, 84:15 discuss [2] - 17:25, 66:19 discussed [1] - 77:10 discussion [2] - 17:7, 38:17 discussions [1] - 17:8 dislike [1] - 63:1 dispose [1] - 69:4

dispositive [1] - 68:24 dispute [3] - 61:18, 61:19, 62:23 disputes [1] - 63:2 disqualification [1] - 36:20 disregard [5] - 7:25, 9:14, 10:11, 72:5, 72:6 disregarded [2] - 7:21 disregarding [1] - 12:8 distinction [1] - 71:2 districts [1] - 78:21 divine [1] - 9:7 **DM**[1] - 46:8 **DMs** [4] - 46:11, 46:13, 74:17 docket [7] - 3:12, 4:17, 6:4, 9:14, 55:13, 72:15, 74:23 document [3] - 5:8, 64:13, 70:19 **Document** [3] - 3:12, 4:17, 6:4 documents [20] - 6:9, 6:10, 6:11, 10:23, 11:5, 16:13, 19:14, 23:8, 23:9, 23:15, 37:7, 45:22, 61:2, 73:3, 74:1, 74:4, 74:11, 82:11, 83:24 dogs [3] - 46:15, 46:18, 46:20 domain [1] - 62:13 done [30] - 9:25, 12:1, 16:14, 26:22, 27:23, 29:14, 38:22, 43:10, 44:9, 44:24, 44:25, 45:9, 45:10, 48:18, 48:19, 52:14, 52:16, 63:11, 63:12, 64:23, 67:25, 68:14, 72:9, 72:11, 72:13, 72:15, 74:22, 77:20, 83:3, 83:18 down [14] - 32:9, 39:3, 40:13, 40:15, 40:22, 42:3, 42:8, 42:9, 54:21, 62:25, 63:1, 65:9, 73:10, 82:8 download [3] - 40:3, 41:12, downloaded [2] - 32:23, downside [1] - 68:12 DQ [2] - 36:19, 36:22 draft [1] - 64:6 drop [1] - 76:13 **Dropbox** [7] - 32:6, 32:13, 32:15, 32:16, 32:17, 32:22, 66:16 dump [2] - 26:22, 39:11 duplicates [1] - 59:3 during [2] - 8:24, 18:24 dynamic [1] - 35:22 e-discovery [13] - 31:18, 53:15, 71:25, 72:16, 72:21, 72:25, 73:2, 73:7, 77:14, 77:16, 83:15 e-vendor [1] - 23:4

early [5] - 16:8, 30:19, 30:20, 37:24 easier [1] - 35:23 East [2] - 11:22, 22:12 **ECF** [4] - 5:15, 12:23, 15:21, 16.1 educate [1] - 24:24 efficiencies [1] - 23:20 efficiency [1] - 28:18 efficient [1] - 33:23 effort [1] - 8:8 efforts [1] - 5:24 either [15] - 5:17, 22:16, 24:24, 27:4, 27:15, 35:6, 39:16, 40:24, 41:1, 43:11, 51:4, 56:15, 74:13, 83:18, 84:1 electronic [4] - 20:12, 26:14, 26:16, 70:24 email [13] - 3:25, 5:15, 6:7, 12:20, 12:23, 13:10, 13:20, 14:6, 17:20, 26:15, 28:6, 53:23 emails [8] - 4:1, 4:12, 7:15, 14:1, 17:21, 32:6, 37:10, 51:4 eminent [1] - 29:2 employment [2] - 69:23, 83:15 encountered [1] - 30:14 encountering [1] - 76:21 end [5] - 7:12, 10:5, 33:17, 51:13, 79:2 ended [1] - 8:18 engage [6] - 29:23, 42:18, 42:19, 42:20, 42:22, 72:16 engaged [6] - 21:16, 24:1, 29:12, 72:22, 72:25, 84:1 engagement [4] - 21:23, 22:8, 29:20, 29:25 engaging [1] - 83:18 England [2] - 59:17, 59:19 **enormously** [1] - 54:22 ensure [1] - 76:7 enter [1] - 3:16 entered [2] - 54:13, 81:11 entire [9] - 8:1, 8:5, 20:11, 20:15, 20:16, 45:3, 48:2, 57:4, 57:9 entirety [4] - 52:14, 52:23, 57:10, 69:5 entities [1] - 23:15 entitled [3] - 24:8, 85:9 entity [1] - 66:20 environment [3] - 32:1, 32:24, 44:19 envisioning [1] - 62:18 Eric [1] - 36:20 Erica [2] - 11:21 Erica's [1] - 12:3

ESI [1] - 24:11 essentially [2] - 42:6, 48:10 estimate [2] - 50:4, 50:5 et [1] - 70:4 evaluation [1] - 53:23 evening [1] - 8:20 event [1] - 43:16 events [1] - 84:8 evidence [2] - 8:3, 69:19 exact [2] - 28:17, 81:5 exactly [4] - 18:23, 35:21, 51:15, 68:6 **example** [9] - 11:7, 34:5, 34:16, 46:8, 51:12, 59:15, 59:17, 61:2, 63:13 Excel [2] - 20:16, 67:14 **exchange** [1] - 14:10 exclude [1] - 62:14 exercise [1] - 28:17 exist [5] - 26:2. 27:16. 27:20. 33:7, 41:7 exists [1] - 39:7 expectation [2] - 62:6, 68:25 expediency [3] - 58:5, 60:20, 65:16 expedient [1] - 72:9 **expensive** [1] - 28:22 expert [2] - 22:17, 22:18 explain [5] - 18:23, 53:20, 53:21, 62:4, 67:9 explained [1] - 20:19 explanation [1] - 4:11 **exploration** [1] - 73:15 explored [1] - 80:5 exploring [1] - 11:6 explosive [1] - 32:25 export [1] - 45:8 express [1] - 11:3 **expressing** [1] - 24:16 expressly [1] - 8:25 extent [11] - 13:8, 15:18, 23:1, 29:14, 30:13, 30:15, 34:22, 76:11, 77:6, 80:13, 80:16 extracted [1] - 28:4 eye [1] - 55:19 eyes [10] - 24:14, 24:16, 54:7, 55:1, 61:3, 61:21, 61:23, 62:9, 62:11, 62:14 face [2] - 3:16, 43:11 Facebook [2] - 40:7, 40:19 facial [1] - 58:6 facially [1] - 52:11 facilitate [1] - 22:13 facility [1] - 77:13 fact [8] - 4:21, 4:24, 5:6, 6:1, 9:1, 46:25, 47:2, 69:15 factor [4] - 43:8, 43:14, 44:8, 45:9

facts [1] - 4:7 failed [1] - 69:11 fair [2] - 72:10, 80:1 fairly [1] - 43:16 faith [3] - 62:4, 75:9, 76:24 falling [1] - 4:11 familiar [1] - 40:8 far [2] - 57:13, 80:1 fast [1] - 70:2 faster [1] - 9:25 fault [1] - 14:15 favor [1] - 34:1 February [4] - 26:23, 35:3, 35:5, 39:22 Federal [1] - 24:9 fees [3] - 5:4, 84:8, 84:9 fell [1] - 3:25 few [6] - 8:22, 47:18, 56:3, 62:9. 62:10. 71:5 fields [1] - 67:13 figure [16] - 8:2, 8:6, 15:16, 20:17, 37:11, 42:13, 42:23, 43:2, 45:20, 56:14, 57:23, 63:4, 65:8, 66:11, 67:12, 82:20 figured [1] - 59:2 file [11] - 3:22, 33:15, 33:16, 33:17, 51:14, 55:7, 60:2, 64:5, 68:21, 69:15, 69:17 filed [9] - 4:4, 8:19, 47:21, 51:24, 55:14, 69:1, 81:3, 81:6, 81:20 files [16] - 13:9, 13:15, 13:22, 13:24, 49:6, 49:13, 49:21, 49:22, 49:23, 50:2, 50:3, 65:25, 66:2, 72:12, 83:3 filing [3] - 4:15, 55:9, 55:18 filtered [1] - 33:14 final [1] - 56:18 finally [1] - 33:25 fine [17] - 21:20, 23:22, 25:24, 29:2, 30:22, 36:17, 38:11, 56:6, 59:17, 71:17, 74:18, 75:5, 76:19, 82:13, 82:25, 83:20, 84:2 finish [1] - 18:18 firm [1] - 36:15 firms [1] - 12:1 first [15] - 3:22, 9:12, 9:19, 24:22, 26:12, 33:10, 33:22, 53:6, 54:15, 55:13, 60:5, 61:11, 61:22, 78:24, 79:6 five [1] - 67:12 floating [1] - 36:4 folder [1] - 47:19 folders [1] - 49:20 folks [2] - 32:8, 57:23 follow [1] - 17:1 following [4] - 6:8, 6:15, 14:7, 32:22

follows [1] - 63:4 foot [1] - 65:9 foregoing [1] - 85:8 forensic [4] - 27:9, 28:20, 28:21, 67:24 forgiveness [2] - 76:17, 81:23 forgot [1] - 15:10 form [2] - 23:16, 44:8 formal [1] - 76:19 forth [4] - 6:8, 33:24, 62:23, 70:15 Forum [3] - 11:22, 22:12, 22:15 forward [4] - 30:24, 36:2, 53:18. 72:8 four [1] - 10:24 fourth [1] - 36:11 frankly [8] - 4:19, 10:7, 15:18, 21:13, 52:14, 54:10, 60:20, 78:2 free [1] - 10:11 Friday [6] - 8:5, 14:18, 44:21, 73:13, 74:6, 74:8 front [4] - 36:23, 38:11, 52:10, 59:9 frustration [1] - 24:17 fulfill [6] - 42:13, 52:16, 53:22, 72:18, 72:20, 77:18 fulfilling [1] - 71:25 full [3] - 34:7, 59:5, 83:15 fully [3] - 36:24, 68:24, 72:2 function [1] - 60:24 fundamentally [1] - 10:8 **FURTHER** [2] - 6:3, 6:5 gaining [1] - 70:2 Gallagher [1] - 36:23 gather [1] - 74:2 gears [1] - 20:21 general [4] - 64:10, 64:11, generally [3] - 25:7, 76:5, 76:6 gilding [1] - 80:6 given [11] - 3:17, 35:24, 41:18, 41:25, 42:2, 54:12, 57:25, 58:7, 69:15, 77:14, 78.5 goal [1] - 83:14 **GOLD** [9] - 22:9, 43:24, 45:7, 69:8, 69:10, 69:17, 70:24, 71:16, 84:23 **Gold** [9] - 17:13, 22:7, 45:6, 69:9, 70:6, 70:11, 71:11, 74:14, 84:22 Gold's [1] - 32:8 Google [1] - 35:7 granted [1] - 58:16 granting [2] - 58:13, 84:9

great [1] - 83:6 guess [17] - 3:25, 7:24, 11:23, 21:4, 27:9, 29:24, 33:9, 36:6, 37:21, 38:11, 47:5, 48:13, 51:19, 58:12, 63:23, 65:15, 77:5 gut [1] - 45:19 **guys** [20] - 17:18, 38:9, 43:2, 44:21, 45:19, 46:23, 52:9, 56:5, 61:19, 62:5, 64:19, 65:22, 66:10, 67:23, 68:7, 71:9, 75:5, 75:9, 75:13, 75:16 half [4] - 30:10, 47:20, 78:24, 79:2 hand [2] - 58:20, 69:25 handed [1] - 35:4 handle [1] - 3:5 handled [1] - 54:5 happy [1] - 44:2 harder [1] - 79:17 head [1] - 41:8 heads [1] - 65:13 hear [17] - 3:19, 3:20, 8:17, 10:4, 36:16, 42:24, 44:2, 46:15, 56:22, 56:23, 57:17, 58:3, 60:12, 70:6, 71:1, 77:1 heard [2] - 20:23, 58:23 hearing [27] - 3:3, 5:16, 7:10, 7:12. 8:4. 9:13. 10:20. 11:2. 13:4, 14:17, 14:22, 14:24, 15:13, 18:4, 20:22, 24:23, 30:19, 45:22, 46:17, 49:4, 56:16, 70:7, 70:8, 80:24, 81:24, 84:10 heck [1] - 14:23 help[1] - 42:23 Hill [1] - 36:14 himself [1] - 45:10 hire [1] - 35:9 hired [2] - 22:2, 34:21 hit [5] - 46:7, 46:10, 48:6, 51:12, 52:6 hits [2] - 25:8, 58:1 hold [1] - 43:25 holding [1] - 28:13 honestly [1] - 78:12 **Honor** [46] - 7:5, 7:24, 11:15, 16:21, 20:5, 22:9, 23:11, 23:24, 24:15, 24:21, 25:6, 25:18, 25:22, 26:10, 27:22, 30:6, 34:17, 36:18, 41:24, 42:4, 43:23, 43:24, 45:2, 45:7, 46:5, 46:22, 50:16, 58:21, 59:5, 59:20, 60:4, 60:9, 64:1, 65:1, 67:6, 69:8, 70:12, 70:24, 75:20, 78:10, 79:4, 82:7, 84:3, 84:5, 84:20, 84:23 Honor's [2] - 47:21, 47:23

hopefully [6] - 13:14, 64:19, 75:13, 77:22, 80:2, 80:3 hours [4] - 77:15, 77:17, 77:19. 81:21 house [1] - 63:14 houses [1] - 63:4 huge [1] - 60:1 hundreds [1] - 23:15 hung [1] - 17:12 hurt [1] - 10:14 husband [1] - 59:16 ID [1] - 43:11 idea [3] - 7:16, 44:18, 65:18 ideal [1] - 44:23 identified [1] - 57:2 identifies [1] - 52:11 identify [7] - 52:9, 59:12, 60:5, 61:16, 61:25, 82:10, 82:11 identity [1] - 39:15 ignore [1] - 9:10 ignored [1] - 11:10 image [1] - 68:2 imaged [2] - 39:22, 41:6 images [30] - 5:21, 5:24, 8:2, 8:6, 8:9, 9:24, 10:3, 11:6, 28:20, 33:13, 34:25, 35:2, 35:3, 35:4, 48:15, 48:22, 49:1, 49:2, 49:6, 49:11, 49:12, 49:20, 49:21, 49:22, 50:1, 67:24, 83:2 imagine [2] - 48:4, 49:14 imaging [2] - 27:9, 40:2 iMessage [1] - 51:12 impact [1] - 79:21 impaired [1] - 69:13 implicate [1] - 56:4 implicated [1] - 55:20 important [5] - 14:23, 37:3, 44:3, 61:7, 65:5 impose [2] - 4:13, 76:7 imposed [4] - 15:10, 15:12, 58:9, 80:24 in-house [1] - 63:14 inappropriate [1] - 74:15 inappropriately [1] - 81:3 inclination [1] - 56:10 include [1] - 83:8 includes [1] - 78:19 including [3] - 75:18, 84:8, inconceivable [1] - 79:11 incorporated [1] - 80:19 increasing [1] - 78:3 independent [1] - 16:19 indicated [1] - 57:2 individual [1] - 34:13 information [36] - 6:9, 11:10, 11:25, 13:19, 13:23, 17:4,

18:15, 22:19, 22:22, 23:1, 23:2, 26:19, 27:25, 38:19, 38:23, 39:9, 39:19, 39:21, 39:23, 42:3, 42:17, 43:6, 45:13, 47:17, 54:15, 69:12, 69:20, 69:25, 70:1, 70:22, 73:9, 75:1, 75:4, 75:22, 75:23 ing [1] - 31:16 initial [1] - 37:5 **insensitive** [1] - 55:22 Instagram [2] - 46:12, 74:17 instance [5] - 54:15, 61:11, 61:22, 74:15, 79:10 instead [2] - 8:17, 51:18 instinct [1] - 45:19 intended [1] - 76:7 interest [4] - 56:1, 56:4, 59:5, 77:24 interested [7] - 10:2, 10:3, 31:16, 65:16, 65:19, 72:8, 78:3 interests [4] - 55:20, 55:23, 56:11, 56:12 intermediate [1] - 19:11 interrogatory [1] - 70:19 intrusive [1] - 53:21 invited [1] - 17:16 invoke [1] - 20:24 involved [13] - 8:15, 12:25, 17:8, 27:11, 31:5, 32:8, 36:12, 36:14, 65:25, 66:20, 68:1, 83:8 involves [1] - 46:5 involving [2] - 38:4, 59:16 iPhone [1] - 27:24 irrelevant [1] - 56:5 ISIM [1] - 39:16 issue [36] - 4:12, 4:23, 5:10, 6:16, 9:17, 10:10, 11:12, 11:13, 12:14, 12:17, 12:23, 36:5, 39:7, 45:21, 45:24, 46:5, 47:9, 47:10, 48:13, 49:5, 54:4, 55:25, 56:16, 57:14, 60:11, 63:10, 71:2, 75:9, 75:10, 76:19, 77:5, 81:6, 82:19, 82:23, 84:16, 84:17 issued [7] - 3:4, 3:10, 4:25, 6:2, 6:15, 7:17, 25:1 **issues** [16] - 3:3, 16:4, 18:23, 30:17, 30:25, 35:23, 36:4, 37:23, 46:25, 53:1, 53:17, 70:10, 71:4, 73:6, 83:14, 84:14 itself [1] - 44:10 **January** [2] - 75:6, 80:10 **Jason** [4] - 11:19, 11:20, 12:2, 15:1 Jersey [2] - 56:19, 78:20

job [2] - 16:18, 50:12 judge [1] - 79:18 Judge [16] - 6:8, 21:16, 22:20, 24:1, 24:4, 26:5, 27:8, 31:12, 34:5, 34:9, 34:19, 36:23, 46:6, 54:8, 65:20, 67:14 judges [1] - 10:10 judgment [13] - 60:2, 60:3, 63:24, 68:18, 69:15, 69:18, 70:1, 77:24, 77:25, 78:1, 78:9, 80:10, 80:20 July [2] - 30:18, 33:20 June [2] - 30:18, 33:20 Junto [6] - 31:24, 32:2, 32:4, 33:2, 33:11 juris [1] - 84:18 jury [1] - 79:19 justice [1] - 10:8 justify [2] - 61:20, 80:8 keep [6] - 20:22, 55:19, 55:21, 60:6, 64:25, 70:9 kept [1] - 22:21 keywords [4] - 23:14, 47:18, 48:6, 67:12 kids [1] - 46:19 kind [11] - 15:22, 22:4, 22:13, 32:18, 34:1, 36:2, 47:8, 48:3, 50:22, 55:12, 57:5 kinds [3] - 62:8, 62:12, 63:2 knowledge [3] - 15:23, 15:24, 16:2 known [3] - 27:25, 37:22, 57.8 **knows** [2] - 33:4, 45:12 laboring [3] - 47:1, 47:2, lack [3] - 3:18, 10:21, 77:13 laid [4] - 3:11, 3:13, 3:17, 58:18 laptop [1] - 41:12 last [13] - 3:4, 10:24, 12:25, 13:5, 38:18, 42:16, 45:21, 57:8, 77:4, 77:12, 77:23, 80:24, 81:24 latter [1] - 39:25 law [1] - 10:9 lawyer [1] - 11:21 lawyers [3] - 11:20, 17:12, 17:14 laying [1] - 75:7 leading [1] - 48:10 leads [1] - 13:4 least [5] - 16:7, 43:8, 49:14, 58:10, 68:20 leave [3] - 43:2, 67:22, 71:8 leaves [1] - 77:23 led [3] - 4:23, 5:18, 10:19 left [5] - 13:7, 13:17, 17:12, 17:14, 69:19

legal [1] - 74:19 legitimate [1] - 76:25 letter [6] - 21:23, 22:8, 29:20, 36:6, 36:7, 76:20 letters [1] - 76:19 letting [1] - 58:8 level [1] - 7:21 life [1] - 57:4 likelihood [1] - 79:9 likely [2] - 53:11 lily [1] - 80:6 limited [1] - 22:19 limits [1] - 62:22 lines [1] - 62:21 link [1] - 41:25 Lisa [1] - 20:8 **Lisa's** [1] - 26:25 list [10] - 19:7, 19:20, 19:25, 20:2, 20:15, 26:12, 26:13, 59:1 litigating [1] - 11:22 litigation [1] - 31:19 load [5] - 33:16, 33:17, 66:2, 66:6 loaded [1] - 66:2 loading [2] - 32:9, 68:3 locally [3] - 39:23, 40:9, 40:18 log [7] - 43:6, 43:8, 43:12, 43:21, 43:22, 44:11, 74:20 log-in [4] - 43:6, 43:12, 43:21, 43:22 logged [2] - 40:21, 53:17 logic [1] - 44:16 logistics [1] - 79:16 look [23] - 15:21, 17:13, 28:24, 37:19, 37:20, 37:25, 42:8, 42:21, 44:19, 45:1, 55:19, 56:8, 58:8, 61:11, 61:13, 61:14, 62:3, 63:3, 65:23, 81:2, 81:18, 85:1 looked [4] - 14:21, 27:23, 28:1, 57:5 looking [9] - 9:14, 12:22, 13:2, 30:21, 53:6, 70:8, 70:9, 70:10, 79:1 loser [1] - 75:12 lost [1] - 43:16 loud [1] - 36:16 love [1] - 65:18 lying [1] - 50:19 maintain [1] - 43:12 manually [2] - 46:12, 46:13 March [1] - 77:19 Marie [1] - 85:12 Marnie [3] - 36:10, 36:21, 37:3 material [6] - 32:2, 52:20, 53:12, 54:18, 55:5, 74:10

materials [6] - 29:1, 29:4, 52:10, 52:11, 74:8, 83:16 matter [5] - 15:5, 27:24, 78:15, 79:3, 85:9 mean [43] - 4:3, 4:11, 6:25, 7:7, 7:9, 9:19, 10:1, 11:25, 12:10, 12:20, 18:15, 24:3, 26:10, 26:11, 27:23, 27:25, 31:17, 34:11, 39:4, 40:7, 41:16, 41:24, 44:11, 48:5, 48:7, 49:24, 49:25, 50:11, 51:3, 62:24, 64:12, 65:9, 68:10, 69:16, 69:17, 70:6, 72:17, 76:24, 77:21, 78:7, 78:13, 80:3, 84:14 meaningful [1] - 11:8 means [5] - 24:15, 24:17, 31:9, 39:15, 41:7 meant [2] - 7:22, 24:24 mechanical [1] - 64:2 media [7] - 13:9, 13:15, 26:15, 28:6, 49:6, 49:12, 49:22 meet [3] - 55:13, 61:16, 62:21 meeting [1] - 71:9 **MEF** [5] - 15:3, 35:14, 35:16, 35:17, 47:18 MEF's [1] - 63:14 memos [1] - 51:1 mention [1] - 83:1 message [9] - 5:3, 26:16, 34:4. 34:13. 43:15. 44:12. 46:7, 64:7, 73:24 messages [59] - 16:10, 19:1, 19:4, 19:7, 19:17, 20:6, 20:7, 20:20, 25:4, 26:11, 26:12, 26:13, 27:19, 28:2, 32:16, 32:20, 38:3, 40:15, 41:5, 45:4, 45:5, 45:8, 45:11, 45:12, 46:7, 46:9, 47:4, 47:7, 47:14, 49:20, 50:21, 50:23, 51:1, 53:11, 54:13, 54:21, 54:24, 54:25, 55:3, 55:8, 55:18, 56:2, 56:3, 56:14, 58:17, 59:23, 60:19, 62:9, 67:7, 68:7, 72:12, 77:7, 82:19, 83:1, 83:2, 83:5, 83:9, 83:10 messaging [3] - 43:7, 44:14, 44:16 met [1] - 76:12 metadata [6] - 16:13, 16:20, 23:9, 24:10, 48:2, 53:23 method [2] - 26:14, 66:18 Meyer [3] - 36:10, 36:21, 37:3 Middle [2] - 11:22, 22:12

midnight [1] - 32:21

midst [1] - 3:24

might [6] - 11:16, 14:21, 48:21, 50:23, 79:12, 79:20 mind [1] - 14:19 mine [1] - 69:2 minimum [1] - 72:5 minute [3] - 16:11, 17:6, 50:6 minutes [4] - 17:12, 18:11, 71:5, 71:7 mirror [1] - 62:20 miss [1] - 5:13 missed [1] - 12:20 Mitchell [1] - 85:12 mitigate [1] - 72:8 MMS [1] - 34:13 **modify** [3] - 55:3, 76:21, 80:11 **mom** [1] - 59:16 Monday [6] - 6:15, 13:12, 17:24, 18:7, 18:8, 18:9 monetary [1] - 76:7 months [2] - 67:10, 67:11 $\pmb{\text{morning}}\ [2] \ \textbf{-}\ 3:2,\ 8:5$ most [12] - 31:18, 31:19, 33:23, 34:23, 37:3, 43:7, 49:22, 50:8, 59:13, 60:13, motion [35] - 3:23, 4:4, 4:22, 5:1, 5:2, 5:20, 8:19, 36:19, 36:22, 47:22, 47:23, 47:24, 51:23, 53:3, 55:9, 55:18, 56:7, 56:17, 58:14, 60:2, 64:5, 64:6, 67:3, 69:15, 69:18, 75:7, 75:10, 75:13, 76:19, 80:25, 81:3, 81:4, 81:6, 81:8, 81:20 motions [5] - 55:3, 55:5, 68:19, 78:2, 80:12 motivated [1] - 84:15 move [1] - 19:12 moving [2] - 70:9, 72:8 MR [182] - 3:20, 3:22, 5:20, 6:20, 6:23, 6:25, 7:24, 8:22, 9:18, 11:15, 11:18, 12:15, 14:6, 14:14, 15:8, 15:13, 16:16, 16:20, 16:24, 17:3, 17:16, 18:3, 18:7, 18:11, 18:14, 19:2, 19:5, 19:19, 19:22, 20:1, 20:5, 21:4, 21:8, 21:11, 21:19, 21:25, 22:3, 22:6, 22:9, 23:5, 23:11, 23:21, 23:24, 24:15, 24:21, 24:25, 25:18, 26:10, 26:22, 26:25, 27:2, 27:6, 27:11, 27:22, 28:5, 28:11, 28:23, 29:17, 29:22, 30:2, 30:5, 31:24, 32:11, 32:13, 33:10, 33:19, 34:14, 34:16, 35:14, 35:17, 35:21, 36:10, 36:14, 36:18, 37:16, 38:3, 38:8, 38:21, 39:1, 39:11, 39:14,

39:18, 40:1, 40:10, 40:16, 40:19, 40:25, 41:3, 41:10, 41:15, 41:20, 41:24, 42:4, 42:15, 42:20, 43:23, 43:24, 44:3, 45:2, 45:7, 45:15, 46:3, 46:19, 47:10, 48:11, 48:17, 48:19, 49:9, 49:18, 49:25, 50:4, 50:8, 50:13, 50:15, 50:17, 50:19, 50:25, 51:6, 51:15, 51:17, 56:23, 56:25, 58:20, 58:23, 59:1, 60:17, 60:21, 61:5, 61:8, 62:17, 63:16, 64:1, 64:10, 64:15, 64:17, 64:25, 65:4, 65:5, 66:13, 66:15, 66:21, 66:25, 67:6, 67:9, 67:18, 67:19, 68:8, 68:15, 68:20, 68:21, 69:1, 69:6, 69:8, 69:10, 69:17. 70:11. 70:16. 70:21. 70:24, 71:15, 71:16, 75:20, 76:23, 77:3, 78:10, 79:4, 79:24, 80:23, 81:2, 81:16, 81:18, 82:2, 82:5, 82:7, 82:15, 82:18, 83:4, 84:3, 84:5, 84:12, 84:20, 84:23 MRI [1] - 59:18 mute [1] - 71:9 naked [2] - 67:1, 68:8 name [5] - 11:19, 39:5, 41:15, 42:1, 43:9 nature [1] - 29:25 navigate [2] - 57:18, 57:22 necessarily [2] - 52:4, 53:12 necessary [1] - 55:16 $\boldsymbol{need}~ {\small [39]} \boldsymbol{\; -4:} 12, \, 4:13, \, 11:13, \,$ 13:9, 17:25, 26:4, 26:6, 26:7, 31:10, 31:17, 31:18, 34:7, 37:4, 37:11, 45:14, 45:20, 47:8, 54:19, 55:4, 64:4, 65:8, 68:7, 70:1, 70:25, 71:4, 71:12, 74:13, 74:20, 76:17, 76:20, 77:17, 78:20, 80:22, 83:2, 83:3, 83:5, 83:13 needed [5] - 5:7, 8:15, 18:5, 26:8, 30:3 needs [7] - 42:3, 55:18, 56:1, 72:16, 72:21, 80:6, 80:14 negligence [1] - 15:20 neutral [6] - 22:12, 22:21, 31:10, 31:16, 65:15, 65:18 never [8] - 3:14, 6:19, 22:16, 23:4, 26:9, 69:1, 70:17, 70:23 **New** [2] - 56:19, 78:20 new [7] - 28:19, 28:20, 35:8, 73:11, 74:5, 83:8, 83:13 next [8] - 29:3, 44:21, 72:14, 72:24, 73:13, 74:6, 74:8, 83:3 night [1] - 42:16

nilly [1] - 79:19 nine [1] - 26:16 nobody [2] - 20:7, 25:3 non [1] - 60:7 non-AEO [1] - 60:7 noncompliance [1] - 16:7 none [3] - 14:12, 40:17, 41:7 normal [1] - 64:13 nothing [2] - 22:25, 50:12 notice [1] - 5:15 notices [2] - 15:21, 16:1 **November** [14] - 3:9, 3:14, 4:25, 5:6, 6:1, 7:9, 7:10, 13:3, 16:7, 16:14, 19:10, 25:1, 53:7 **nowhere** [1] - 7:8 number [4] - 39:16, 44:5, 44:12, 59:10 **objection** [2] - 64:3, 64:25 objections [2] - 52:15, 53:16 **obligation** [10] - 5:14, 23:10, 42:13, 42:21, 52:17, 55:13, 61:16, 72:18, 72:23 obligations [12] - 23:23, 25:15, 25:16, 31:2, 47:3, 52:22, 53:22, 62:21, 71:25, 72:2, 81:13, 81:25 obstacles [1] - 76:25 obtain [2] - 73:2, 83:23 obviate [1] - 83:13 obvious [3] - 64:19, 64:20 obviously [3] - 37:22, 44:23, 84.14 October [3] - 30:17, 37:14, offer [3] - 42:16, 44:17, 48:3 officer [1] - 63:15 Official [1] - 85:12 often [1] - 76:6 once [8] - 13:6, 13:7, 43:10, 43:18, 78:14, 78:16, 79:17 one [42] - 4:8, 5:3, 5:4, 5:9, 12:10, 12:13, 21:25, 22:6, 25:2, 26:18, 27:15, 27:16, 32:5, 36:10, 36:25, 37:3, 38:25, 43:25, 46:9, 46:24, 47:10, 49:3, 49:14, 49:21, 54:5, 61:4, 61:11, 63:9, 63:23, 66:25, 68:21, 69:1, 70:16, 70:18, 70:19, 76:17, 79:11, 79:14, 81:7, 81:22 ones [4] - 20:24, 59:7, 59:16, 79:12 open [6] - 41:1, 47:9, 47:10, 55:2, 56:16, 65:16 opportunity [1] - 8:14 **opposed** [2] - 34:12, 34:15 order [114] - 3:1, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:23, 3:24, 4:16, 4:18, 4:23, 4:24, 4:25, 5:3, 5:7,

5:10, 5:11, 5:17, 5:18, 5:19, 6:2, 6:13, 6:15, 6:17, 6:18, 6:21, 6:24, 7:4, 7:9, 7:10, 7:17, 7:21, 7:22, 7:25, 8:8, 8:11, 9:2, 9:7, 9:22, 9:23, 10:19, 11:9, 11:11, 11:13, 12:19, 13:4, 14:2, 15:19, 15:25, 16:3, 16:6, 16:7, 16:8, 16:12, 16:16, 19:10, 19:13, 20:22, 21:17, 22:21, 24:9, 25:1, 25:3, 25:4, 25:6, 30:6, 34:5, 34:19, 37:15, 47:21, 52:2, 52:13, 53:24, 54:3, 54:6, 54:10, 54:12, 54:14, 54:25, 55:1, 57:19, 58:13, 58:15, 58:23, 59:8, 60:14, 61:14, 61:15, 62:19, 62:20, 63:18. 63:20. 64:22. 65:1. 67:17, 69:25, 71:4, 72:13, 75:17, 75:25, 77:9, 77:15, 77:21, 77:22, 79:8, 80:8, 80:11, 81:11, 82:9, 83:22, 84:7, 84:9 **ORDERED** [2] - 6:4, 6:5 ordered [13] - 8:25, 9:25, 15:6, 19:4, 19:18, 25:7, 27:9, 30:5, 35:3, 46:6, 52:23, 53:5, 64:15 ordering [4] - 31:7, 45:3, 53:4, 60:19 orders [26] - 3:4, 3:6, 4:12, 4:13, 9:6, 9:15, 10:10, 12:5, 12:7, 12:10, 12:23, 15:18, 16:8, 24:4, 26:1, 29:10, 33:7, 65:21, 65:22, 69:11, 70:4, 71:24, 72:6, 76:8, 81:25 originally [1] - 25:9 otherwise [4] - 56:12, 58:18, 65:24. 74:19 ourselves [3] - 60:22, 60:23, 77:15 outcome [1] - 43:3 outline [2] - 77:8, 77:9 outlined [2] - 77:6, 77:8 outset [1] - 66:24 outstanding [3] - 46:2, 82:19, 82:22 overbroad [3] - 53:11, 54:1, 58:11 overdesignate [1] - 60:15 overlap [2] - 29:7, 52:21 overlapped [2] - 29:8, 29:9 overlapping [1] - 29:14 own [4] - 32:1, 34:24, 35:9, 77:24 p.m [1] - 85:4 page [2] - 53:8, 53:13 pandemic [1] - 30:20

Pansy [1] - 54:14

paper [1] - 78:3

paralegal [4] - 11:18, 14:3, 14:12, 14:13 paralegal's [1] - 12:16 parallel [2] - 21:21, 23:1 parcel [1] - 80:4 parent [2] - 24:10, 24:18 parent-child [2] - 24:10, 24.18 parlay [1] - 23:17 part [17] - 10:20, 12:2, 18:22, 21:12, 24:19, 39:21, 49:10, 53:2, 56:8, 58:14, 58:16, 75:22, 80:4, 82:9, 83:7, 83:20 partial [2] - 68:20, 68:24 participation [1] - 84:8 particular [3] - 9:16, 12:24, 72:1 particularly [2] - 44:18, 75:25 parties [13] - 10:11, 14:6, 21:1, 23:11, 23:14, 23:17, 25:18, 25:19, 25:20, 36:8, 37:18, 37:20, 81:4 party [11] - 16:19, 16:20, 22:12, 22:22, 26:18, 27:8, 31:10, 31:16, 37:2, 65:15, 75:12 passcodes [1] - 39:5 password [2] - 41:15, 43:9 past [3] - 57:15, 77:1, 78:9 pay [5] - 7:7, 75:12, 75:17, 76:1. 80:24 paying [7] - 9:3, 21:8, 22:15, 25:13, 35:12, 35:15, 35:16 penalty [1] - 76:7 pending [1] - 36:19 Pennsylvania [1] - 77:18 people [11] - 16:21, 17:21, 20:5, 20:6, 30:21, 44:17, 51:18, 59:17, 60:14, 78:16, 79:7 per [1] - 34:5 percent [1] - 48:20 period [2] - 8:24, 21:11 permission [2] - 76:17, 81:24 person [2] - 12:4, 57:8 perspective[1] - 15:20 persuading [1] - 83:19 ph [1] - 59:18 phone [22] - 11:5, 18:10, 20:14, 20:17, 27:23, 27:24, 28:1, 28:4, 39:24, 40:2, 40:20, 40:24, 41:1, 41:7, 43:19, 44:5, 44:10, 44:12, 57:5, 57:6, 67:25 phones [17] - 26:22, 26:24, 27:1, 27:9, 27:13, 27:14, 27:16, 27:20, 28:5, 28:8,

28:10, 35:4, 35:6, 39:21, 41:6 picked [1] - 78:19 picture [1] - 3:6 pictures [4] - 67:1, 68:8, 74:15, 82:25 piece [1] - 35:9 place [9] - 52:18, 52:19, 53:6, 53:16, 60:14, 63:22, 73:2, 76:11, 83:13 plaintiff [10] - 21:13, 25:6, 25:7, 36:11, 71:23, 72:16, 72:25, 73:21, 75:17, 76:1 Plaintiff's [1] - 6:6 plaintiff's [1] - 72:22 plaintiffs [2] - 37:5, 59:23 planet [1] - 25:2 planned [1] - 20:22 planning [2] - 78:24, 84:7 plant [1] - 26:18 platform [6] - 22:23, 31:23, 31:25, 33:3, 33:11 platforms [1] - 26:17 playing [1] - 62:19 plenty [1] - 20:9 plus [1] - 48:2 point [11] - 12:21, 15:10, 25:20, 27:8, 31:1, 52:12, 64:22, 66:13, 67:8, 70:16, 77:25 popped [1] - 5:14 portion [2] - 5:2, 55:8 portions [3] - 5:3, 55:3, position [2] - 21:19, 70:3 positioned [1] - 31:12 possible [2] - 10:1, 17:22 potential [1] - 37:25 potentially [2] - 52:12, 73:3 **pox** [1] - 63:3 practical [3] - 60:12, 78:15, 79:2 practice [3] - 8:5, 12:22, 50:22 preclusion [1] - 69:24 preferably [1] - 73:9 prejudice [5] - 9:20, 10:4, 10:6, 11:11, 70:9 prejudiced [1] - 69:19 preparing [2] - 75:18, 76:1 present [1] - 8:5 preserve [2] - 54:14, 58:9 preserved [1] - 56:1 pressed [1] - 30:18 presume [3] - 4:15, 39:15, 64.19 **pretty** [7] - 4:6, 15:6, 15:7, 32:25, 71:22, 80:18, 81:3 prevailing [1] - 75:12

previously [2] - 16:13, 38:5 privacy [10] - 53:1, 54:5, 54:15, 55:20, 55:23, 55:25, 56:4, 56:11, 56:12, 58:4 private [2] - 53:3, 54:18 privilege [1] - 53:17 problem [12] - 10:12, 14:25, 24:6, 24:7, 24:19, 27:15, 29:16, 69:10, 69:22, 69:23, 76:18, 76:20 **problematic** [1] - 25:15 problems [8] - 23:7, 30:14, 31:21, 34:4, 34:17, 35:11, 76:15 Procedure [1] - 24:10 **Proceedings** [1] - 85:4 **proceedings** [1] - 85:9 process [11] - 28:22, 30:20, 43:4, 44:25, 52:7, 53:14, 53:15, 62:18, 73:1, 75:22, 83:23 produce [29] - 5:24, 16:12, 16:24, 17:3, 17:4, 20:4, 20:25, 22:20, 23:8, 23:9, 25:6, 25:8, 29:4, 33:8, 39:3, 46:6, 46:10, 47:11, 47:17, 52:22, 53:10, 53:24, 56:13, 57:7, 57:9, 62:7, 74:15, 83:23, 84:1 produced [48] - 6:10, 13:8, 13:9, 13:16, 16:13, 17:1, 19:24, 23:2, 24:11, 25:4, 25:5, 25:9, 31:7, 32:16, 34:3, 37:12, 41:5, 45:3, 45:5, 45:23, 45:25, 46:1, 47:13, 47:20, 47:24, 48:21, 48:22, 48:25, 49:15, 54:9, 54:17, 54:20, 54:24, 54:25, 66:15, 67:4, 67:19, 73:22, 73:25, 75:1, 75:4, 75:8, 75:22, 75:23, 77:7, 80:4, 82:21, produces [2] - 32:15, 32:17 producing [9] - 6:11, 19:1, 19:17, 21:20, 36:21, 48:24, 66:5, 66:9, 66:10 **production** [31] - 5:4, 16:19, 16:23, 19:4, 19:14, 23:16, 25:8, 29:5, 29:6, 29:13, 33:22, 38:19, 41:6, 47:23, 52:2, 52:13, 52:18, 52:23, 53:4, 53:5, 58:16, 60:19, 61:2, 66:8, 72:12, 73:16, 74:9, 74:13, 74:22, 77:6, 83.14 productions [5] - 27:17, 31:6, 32:6, 38:7, 60:15 progress [5] - 5:8, 8:14, 13:10, 13:23, 30:24 prompt [1] - 74:24

proportional [1] - 57:10 proportionality [4] - 57:12, 57:17, 57:18, 58:4 propose [2] - 18:25, 75:3 proposed [2] - 19:3, 58:23 prosecuting [2] - 69:13, 69:21 prosecution [1] - 10:7 protective [10] - 29:10, 54:2, 54:6, 54:10, 54:14, 57:19, 60:14, 61:15, 62:20, 63:20 provide [9] - 7:14, 19:6, 19:7, 19:16, 19:23, 29:13, 33:6, 73:8, 74:20 provided [4] - 11:1, 18:14, 41:17, 74:5 providing [1] - 5:7 provision [1] - 54:7 provisions [4] - 58:17, 61:13, 62:19, 77:8 prudential [1] - 84:18 **public** [2] - 55:12, 62:13 pull [8] - 19:13, 24:3, 39:3, 40:13, 40:21, 42:3, 42:9, 73:10 pulled [4] - 20:15, 66:17, 66:19, 66:23 pulling [3] - 32:9, 40:14, 42:8 punch [1] - 44:13 purpose [3] - 11:3, 16:1, purposes [2] - 64:11, 78:24 pursuant [4] - 19:17, 21:16, 52:19, 54:25 push [3] - 30:24, 60:14, 77:25 put [16] - 11:23, 14:14, 38:11, 43:15, 54:7, 54:10, 55:25, 56:7. 62:13. 62:19. 65:9. 65:12, 65:13, 73:1, 76:11, 82:9 putting [5] - 8:8, 15:2, 59:10, 63:22, 65:19 quarter [1] - 79:1 questions [4] - 18:19, 18:20, 37:13, 55:5 queue [2] - 78:16, 79:5 quick [1] - 64:1 quickly [3] - 67:25, 68:14, 80:18 quite [2] - 27:20, 84:17 raise [2] - 26:8, 58:20 raised [6] - 7:9, 16:5, 24:22, 30:17, 37:25, 57:14 raising [1] - 30:16 ran [2] - 35:11, 59:3 range [2] - 82:16, 82:17 rather [1] - 45:18

raw [1] - 34:25

RDR [1] - 85:12

reach [4] - 52:4, 62:5, 75:5, 75.6 reactions [1] - 12:11 read [10] - 4:13, 7:4, 7:6, 7:13, 14:10, 15:25, 47:20, 51:23, 64:17, 64:18 ready [1] - 79:8 real [2] - 14:24, 80:17 reality [1] - 60:12 realize [1] - 12:6 realized [1] - 30:23 really [13] - 7:22, 9:3, 10:15, 17:25. 53:19. 58:2. 63:1. 63:6, 63:7, 63:8, 69:2, 77:16 reason [12] - 8:13, 9:9, 9:13, 14:15, 23:12, 46:21, 52:7, 52:24, 53:20, 58:6, 79:4, 81:11 reasons [1] - 12:10 recent [2] - 38:7, 43:12 recently [1] - 75:8 recess [3] - 71:6, 71:18, 71:20 reckless [1] - 72:5 recognize [4] - 53:1, 54:15, 54:17, 74:24 recognized [1] - 53:10 recollection [1] - 22:9 reconfirm [1] - 43:15 reconsider [1] - 82:1 reconsideration [15] - 3:23, 4:5, 4:22, 5:21, 6:18, 8:19, 47:22, 48:9, 51:21, 51:23, 56:13, 58:14, 67:3, 81:6, 81:15 record [17] - 5:16, 6:3, 7:13, 13:5, 15:17, 51:13, 58:18, 71:18, 71:22, 72:4, 73:5, 77:9, 77:11, 81:2, 81:13, 82:1, 85:9 recording [1] - 51:12 recordings [2] - 49:7, 51:4 redact [5] - 56:6, 68:8, 74:12, 74:19, 74:20 redacted [4] - 46:12, 46:13, 74:1, 74:2 redaction [1] - 74:21 redactions [8] - 45:23, 45:25, 46:3, 46:4, 46:22, 74:10, 82:10 reduce [1] - 77:22 reducing [1] - 78:3 reference [1] - 32:5 referenced [1] - 74:14 refuse [4] - 20:25, 29:17, 29:19, 29:22 $\pmb{\text{refused}}\ [3] \ \textbf{-}\ 17{:}3,\ 19{:}15,$ 23.8 regard [4] - 19:17, 69:12, 69:20, 69:23

regardless [2] - 11:11, 15:10 regular [1] - 30:9 related [3] - 22:10, 59:14, 59:22 relationship [2] - 24:18, 35:19 relationships [1] - 24:11 relatively [2] - 68:14, 72:13 Relativity [6] - 32:1, 32:3, 32:23, 33:11, 33:18, 66:7 relevance [3] - 48:4, 52:3, relevant [15] - 11:16, 31:7, 45:4. 45:5. 48:5. 48:23. 52:4. 52:12, 52:25, 53:12, 57:22, 58:6, 62:16, 73:25, 83:16 relied [1] - 12:4 relying [1] - 25:11 remedies [1] - 3:8 remedy [1] - 15:16 remember [2] - 14:24, 45:15 remote [1] - 44:18 reopen [5] - 74:25, 75:4, 75:8, 75:11, 75:24 reopened [5] - 75:15, 75:21, 80:2, 80:6, 80:17 reopening [1] - 80:8 report [18] - 6:6, 6:12, 6:14, 13:6, 13:12, 17:7, 19:16, 21:15, 44:23, 59:4, 72:24, 73:13, 73:20, 74:6, 83:5, 83:6, 83:9 reported [1] - 10:25 Reporter [1] - 85:12 reports [4] - 6:16, 6:19, 6:23, 12:18 represented [3] - 6:25, 36:11, 37:6 representing [1] - 36:22 represents [1] - 37:9 request [5] - 58:24, 59:11, 60:4, 70:19, 84:16 requests [1] - 70:17 require [2] - 56:13, 83:22 required [2] - 3:14, 60:5 requirement [6] - 9:2, 14:9, 15:9, 15:11, 15:24, 53:10 requirements [2] - 19:18, 77:18 requiring [3] - 7:17, 11:3, 15:19 resolution [1] - 47:8 resolve [1] - 70:10 resolved [3] - 36:22, 36:24, 46:4 respect [3] - 37:22, 73:6, 74:1 respectfully [2] - 59:20, 60:4 respects [1] - 57:20 respond [9] - 9:2, 16:2,

18:24, 20:17, 44:1, 52:1, 54:23, 56:17, 70:11 responded [2] - 3:15, 20:12 response [6] - 3:18, 4:16, 15:19, 16:5, 37:10, 44:3 responses [1] - 3:14 responsibility [1] - 24:20 responsive [5] - 73:3, 73:17, 73:21, 73:23, 73:24 restrictions [4] - 26:2, 52:19, 58:8, 74:3 result [1] - 75:22 retain [1] - 21:6 retained [4] - 21:2, 22:16, 22:17, 23:4 review [8] - 5:8, 11:6, 13:7, 13:17, 48:14, 53:14, 64:14, 65:2 reviewed [4] - 6:9, 11:5, 13:22, 13:24 reviewing [4] - 6:11, 10:23, 13:25, 52:17 rise [1] - 77:14 risk [1] - 43:21 RMR [1] - 85:12 road [1] - 62:25 Rob [1] - 42:15 role [1] - 72:20 rolling [2] - 24:14, 24:16 Roman [1] - 59:6 room [1] - 71:13 rule [1] - 67:3 Rules [1] - 24:9 ruling [5] - 47:23, 56:18, 56:19, 56:20, 77:21 run [4] - 34:17, 47:16, 67:11, 76:15 rung [1] - 57:13 running [1] - 76:25 **Sanchez** [6] - 27:8, 31:13, 34:9, 46:6, 65:20, 67:14 Sanchez's [8] - 21:17, 22:21, 24:1, 24:4, 26:5, 34:5, 34:19, 54:8 sanction [3] - 52:14, 76:12, 76:22 sanctionable [1] - 9:17 sanctions [9] - 3:3, 3:10, 3:11, 3:13, 3:17, 70:8, 72:4, 77:5, 81:8 sat [2] - 20:14, 20:16 **savings** [1] - 83:19 **saw** [3] - 4:15, 15:7, 27:8 schedule [7] - 19:1, 19:3, 19:17, 19:24, 20:3, 78:5, 79:19 scheduled [3] - 37:14, 80:13, scheduling [3] - 36:8, 38:10, 80:11

school [1] - 46:19 scope [1] - 54:16 seal [7] - 55:19, 55:21, 56:8, 64:5, 64:9 search [2] - 52:6 searched [1] - 33:13 second [2] - 12:19, 76:2 secondly [1] - 12:17 seconds [1] - 50:9 secret [25] - 21:10, 21:17, 22:7, 22:10, 22:14, 23:2, 23:13, 25:16, 26:2, 29:6, 29:15. 29:25. 31:11. 31:25. 32:8, 33:7, 33:22, 34:3, 35:19, 47:1, 47:2, 52:8, 52:20, 52:22, 74:3 security [1] - 43:17 see [23] - 4:1, 9:14, 12:10, 13:9, 14:3, 14:22, 17:1, 17:13, 24:13, 31:11, 31:12, 33:22, 37:20, 42:9, 42:11, 47:16, 48:12, 62:20, 66:8, 66:9, 76:25 seeing [2] - 12:21, 63:19 seeking [1] - 69:20 seem [4] - 16:6, 29:16, 53:14, 53:15 send [6] - 6:23, 8:24, 9:20, 14:1, 44:6, 51:18 sending [2] - 32:11, 33:15 sends [2] - 51:2, 51:10 sense [6] - 4:20, 28:19, 29:2, 60:9, 60:10, 79:13 sensitive [2] - 54:18, 63:7 **sent** [8] - 8:18, 8:22, 8:23, 26:16, 36:6, 37:10, 49:19, 57:4 separate [3] - 14:9, 57:24, 60:6 September [1] - 35:24 series [1] - 3:4 serve [1] - 37:1 served [1] - 70:17 server [4] - 39:24, 40:3, 40:4, 40:6 servers [1] - 40:18 services [4] - 43:7, 44:14, 44:16, 51:8 set [4] - 12:19, 17:18, 19:9, 71:13 Seth [2] - 32:13 sets [2] - 6:8, 65:22 settings [1] - 40:12 settling [1] - 78:17 seven [2] - 3:5, 12:25 several [3] - 20:11, 39:2, 53:3

severely [2] - 69:13, 69:19

shaking [1] - 41:8

shall [1] - 6:6

share [1] - 79:20 sharing [2] - 11:25, 26:7 shift [2] - 20:21, 57:22 **Shikunov** [4] - 11:21, 36:11, 36:20 shock [1] - 43:13 **short** [2] - 54:12, 72:13 **short-circuit** [1] - 54:12 shorter [1] - 50:10 **show** [23] - 3:10, 3:17, 4:16, 4:18, 4:23, 4:24, 5:10, 5:18, 6:15, 7:22, 9:3, 10:19, 12:19, 15:19. 16:3. 16:6. 25:25. 59:8, 60:7, 62:1, 62:16, 63:8, 71:4 **showing** [1] - 63:13 **shown** [3] - 55:2, 55:4, 59:6 **shows** [2] - 51:13, 72:4 Signal [1] - 39:7 significant [1] - 80:7 **SIM** [1] - 39:16 simple [1] - 10:21 simplest [1] - 67:21 single [5] - 5:9, 34:13, 43:8, 57:7, 57:8 single-factor [1] - 43:8 singling [1] - 79:22 Siri [2] - 51:9, 51:10 sit [1] - 42:24 situation [2] - 60:18, 76:16 **six** [3] - 3:5, 12:25, 77:15 slice [1] - 62:15 **slip** [1] - 80:1 slot [1] - 79:11 **slotting** [1] - 79:16 slow [1] - 54:21 small [1] - 10:20 smirking [2] - 24:13, 24:15 SMS [1] - 34:13 SMSs [1] - 51:3 snippet [1] - 26:14 snippets [1] - 25:5 social [3] - 26:15, 28:6, 35:7 solely [1] - 60:24 solution [1] - 63:4 someone [5] - 27:13, 31:8, 51:4, 51:5, 73:12 **sometime** [1] - 78:10 **sometimes** [1] - 56:2 somewhat [2] - 72:7, 73:11 somewhere [6] - 21:24, 39:24, 40:3, 41:5, 41:23, 43:22 soon [2] - 17:22, 78:7 sorry [8] - 32:14, 36:18, 41:10, 46:15, 58:20, 79:4, 83:2

sort [19] - 3:7, 12:4, 12:7,

33:15, 33:16, 35:24, 36:1,

43:6, 43:13, 43:20, 44:17, 57:16, 58:4, 61:1, 66:23, 71:3, 77:5, 84:18, 84:19 sorting [1] - 57:21 sound [1] - 53:15 sounds [2] - 48:15, 66:22 source [1] - 67:25 space [1] - 79:20 specifically [1] - 72:22 **specifics** [1] - 64:6 speed [1] - 11:6 spend [2] - 57:21, 68:13 spent [3] - 6:11, 13:25, 75:18 spirit [2] - 9:5, 9:7 spoken [1] - 83:25 **spreadsheet** [3] - 20:16, 33:1, 67:14 stake [1] - 53:2 stand [5] - 3:7, 36:5, 49:8, 54:4, 85:1 standpoint [4] - 28:18, 57:17, 64:2, 84:19 stands [1] - 47:5 start [12] - 3:9, 5:7, 28:19, 28:25, 35:8, 38:25, 43:1, 52:12, 52:21, 54:20, 78:17, 79:17 starting [2] - 6:5, 29:4 **status** [16] - 6:6, 6:12, 6:13, 6:14, 6:16, 6:19, 6:23, 11:1, 14:6, 14:8, 19:16, 21:1, 21:4, 36:3, 37:19, 70:8 stay [3] - 18:12, 18:16, 18:20 stayed [1] - 18:20 steadfastly [1] - 70:4 step [5] - 29:3, 36:1, 60:5, 71:13. 71:15 steps [1] - 44:25 still [20] - 5:11, 13:9, 18:5, 27:1, 34:4, 36:5, 36:8, 36:9, 37:9, 37:18, 38:1, 44:13, 46:2, 47:9, 56:11, 57:16, 62:3, 67:6, 67:24, 82:1 stipulate [5] - 63:18, 65:14, 65:22, 72:19 stipulation [1] - 65:23 storage [1] - 28:7 store [2] - 41:25, 42:1 stored [6] - 39:23, 39:24, 40:8, 40:11, 40:18 storing [2] - 43:21, 51:3 stream [1] - 12:20 strictly [1] - 22:10 strikes [1] - 10:8 string [2] - 46:9, 59:12 strings [2] - 52:5, 59:12 studied [1] - 24:3 stuff [17] - 15:16, 32:9, 32:25, 33:3, 38:5, 53:24, 54:1, 54:16, 54:20, 56:1,

56:4, 58:10, 61:25, 74:12, 80:3, 80:14, 84:2 subject [11] - 29:10, 33:6, 47:23, 58:8, 58:17, 61:23, 63:17, 63:18, 63:19, 70:22, 77:7 **submission** [3] - 16:5, 55:12, 64:23 **submit** [12] - 6:6, 6:12, 6:13, 6:14, 6:19, 55:7, 55:9, 55:11, 56:6, 64:8, 64:13, 65:23 submitted [1] - 70:23 **submitting** [1] - 55:18 subpoena [2] - 37:11, 37:24 subpoenas [1] - 37:2 subsequent [1] - 84:9 subsequently [1] - 10:20 substance [1] - 38:15 substantial [2] - 30:16, 49:12 substantially [1] - 29:9 **successful** [1] - 37:2 suggest [3] - 9:18, 16:6, 47:11 suggested [1] - 47:6 **suggesting** [1] - 14:15 suggestion [1] - 57:1 **summary** [13] - 60:1, 60:3, 63:24, 68:18, 69:15, 69:18, 70:1, 77:23, 77:25, 78:1, 78:9, 80:10, 80:20 super [1] - 23:16 supplements [1] - 78:2 supposed [2] - 19:23, 46:10 surprise [1] - 44:15 surprised [4] - 43:5, 43:18, 78:25 suspend [1] - 76:9 suspicious [1] - 69:14 system [4] - 10:8, 10:9, 10:16 tackle [2] - 55:4, 73:7 tap [1] - 65:20 team [1] - 61:12 tee [1] - 62:23 teed [1] - 71:3 Telegram [26] - 38:17, 38:19, 38:23, 39:4, 39:5, 39:6, 39:19, 39:23, 40:22, 41:2, 41:5, 41:11, 42:5, 42:10, 43:1, 43:20, 45:3, 45:8, 45:11, 73:8, 73:10, 73:15, 73:17, 73:21, 73:24 telephone [4] - 20:11, 39:6, 39:13, 39:19 temporal [1] - 62:22 ten [2] - 17:12, 47:12 tentative [2] - 56:19, 56:20 term [1] - 52:6 terms [11] - 22:5, 22:19, 28:15, 31:20, 33:6, 52:5,

52:6, 62:21, 69:13, 69:20, 80:6 terribly [1] - 17:8 test [2] - 47:16, 67:11 text [71] - 5:3, 16:10, 19:1, 19:4, 19:7, 19:17, 19:20, 20:6, 20:7, 20:20, 25:4, 25:6, 25:8, 26:11, 26:12, 26:13, 27:19, 32:16, 32:20, 34:4, 34:8, 38:3, 41:10, 43:14, 44:12, 47:4, 47:7, 47:11, 47:12, 47:14, 47:19, 48:1, 48:2, 48:4, 50:23, 51:10, 51:13, 52:5, 52:17, 53:10, 53:24, 54:13, 54:21, 54:24, 54:25, 55:3, 55:8, 55:18, 56:2, 56:13, 57:2, 57:3, 57:6, 57:7, 58:6, 58:16, 59:23, 60:19, 62:7, 62:15, 66:15, 67:7, 72:12, 77:6, 82:19, 83:1, 83:2, 83:5, 83:9, 83:10 texting [2] - 51:18, 59:17 texts [4] - 51:2, 51:4, 59:18, 65:6 Thanksgiving [2] - 32:21, The court [176] - 3:2, 3:21, 4:9, 5:23, 6:6, 6:21, 6:24, 7:6, 8:10, 8:23, 10:2, 11:17, 12:11, 12:16, 14:8, 15:5, 15:9, 15:14, 16:18, 16:22, 17:1, 17:6, 17:20, 18:4, 18:9, 18:12, 18:25, 19:3, 19:9, 19:20, 19:23, 20:3, 20:21, 21:6, 21:10, 21:15, 21:23, 22:1, 22:4, 22:7, 23:6, 23:19, 23:22, 23:25, 24:19, 24:22, 25:10, 25:23, 26:20, 26:24, 27:1, 27:4, 27:7, 27:13, 28:3, 28:9, 28:12, 28:24, 29:19, 29:24, 30:3, 30:8, 32:4, 32:12, 33:2, 33:15, 34:12, 34:15, 35:13, 35:15, 35:18, 35:22, 36:13, 36:17, 37:13, 37:17, 38:7, 38:9, 38:22, 39:10, 39:12, 39:15, 39:23, 40:5, 40:11, 40:17, 40:23, 41:1, 41:8, 41:13, 41:17, 41:22, 41:25, 42:7, 42:19, 42:21, 43:25, 44:8, 45:5, 45:14, 45:16, 46:17, 46:23, 48:8, 48:12, 48:18, 49:5, 49:16, 49:23, 50:3, 50:6, 50:11, 50:14, 50:24, 51:2, 51:11, 51:16, 51:21, 56:24, 57:12, 58:22, 58:25, 60:10, 60:18, 60:22, 61:6, 61:9, 62:18, 63:15, 63:17, 64:8, 64:11, 64:16, 64:18, 65:3, 65:7, 66:14, 66:17, 66:22,

67:5, 67:21, 68:10, 68:16, 68:23, 69:4, 69:7, 69:9, 69:16, 70:6, 70:13, 70:20, 71:1, 71:17, 71:21, 75:21, 76:24, 77:4, 78:12, 79:7, 79:25, 81:1, 81:10, 81:17, 81:22, 82:3, 82:6, 82:13, 82:16, 82:22, 83:5, 84:4, 84:7, 84:11, 84:13, 84:21, 84:25 theories [1] - 63:24 thereafter [1] - 6:5 they've [3] - 33:13, 74:25, 84:1 thinking [1] - 51:25 thinks [1] - 65:21 third [8] - 27:7, 31:10, 31:16, 37:2, 37:17, 37:20, 65:15, 79:1 third-party [3] - 31:16, 37:2, 65:15 thousands [1] - 23:15 thread [6] - 34:15, 48:2, 57:4, 57:9, 58:1, 62:7 threading [2] - 53:23, 53:24 threads [27] - 20:1, 25:7, 25:8, 27:22, 28:2, 32:21, 32:25, 34:8, 47:12, 47:19, 48:1, 48:4, 48:5, 52:17, 57:2, 57:6, 57:25, 58:6, 59:2, 59:6, 60:5, 60:7, 61:23, 62:7, 66:15, 67:1 three [2] - 10:24, 46:19 throughout [3] - 20:23, 25:11, 38:16 throws [1] - 32:17 thumbprint [1] - 43:11 time-consuming [1] - 28:21 timing [1] - 38:14 today [21] - 6:5, 7:1, 9:22, 11:5, 11:18, 15:16, 16:9, 17:25, 24:25, 42:17, 48:21, 48:22, 49:4, 50:13, 58:15, 70:7, 73:10, 73:18, 77:22, 81:13, 82:19 together [2] - 20:15, 65:14 took [3] - 7:12, 32:21, 52:18 total [1] - 50:5 totally [1] - 18:18 touched [1] - 48:13 towards [2] - 55:20, 78:15 trade [25] - 21:10, 21:17, 22:7, 22:10, 22:13, 23:2, 23:13, 25:16, 26:2, 29:5, 29:14, 29:25, 31:11, 31:25, 32:8, 33:7, 33:21, 34:3, 35:19, 47:1, 47:2, 52:8, 52:19, 52:22, 74:3 traded [1] - 20:12

transcribed [1] - 49:24

transcript [6] - 13:3, 15:7, 15:8, 53:7, 53:13, 85:8 transcripts [2] - 80:15, 80:18 tread [1] - 54:8 $\pmb{\text{treat}}\, {\scriptscriptstyle [5]} - 54.6,\, 56.21,\, 59.16,$ 60:6, 62:9 treated [3] - 55:1, 59:19, 59:20 **trial** [9] - 55:10, 78:7, 78:8, 78:14, 78:16, 79:8, 79:14, 79:15, 79:17 trials [5] - 78:14, 79:5, 79:12, 79:17, 79:19 tried [6] - 11:23, 20:14, 20:16, 47:16, 47:17, 78:20 triggered [1] - 4:24 troubled [2] - 4:10, 77:12 true [2] - 27:15, 57:13 try [8] - 3:7, 9:8, 23:17, 38:22, 38:23, 55:14, 63:4, 67:12 **trying** [10] - 8:2, 8:6, 9:6, 37:1, 37:11, 47:15, 57:16, 57:21, 65:19, 67:16 Tuesday [6] - 32:22, 32:23, 72:14, 72:24, 83:3, 83:21 turn [2] - 51:21, 71:9 turned [1] - 80:18 turning [2] - 66:6, 69:12 Twitter [4] - 46:8, 46:9, 46:11, 74:17 two [19] - 5:3, 11:20, 12:1, 12:11, 17:21, 27:15, 43:14, 44:8, 45:9, 46:19, 50:6, 59:6, 59:7, 59:10, 65:20, 66:25, 73:17, 79:12, 79:14 two-day [2] - 79:12, 79:14 two-factor [3] - 43:14, 44:8, two-minute [1] - 50:6 **type** [3] - 34:17, 44:6, 54:14 typical [4] - 43:16, 61:1, 61:2, 61:15 typically [3] - 43:7, 50:6, 62:20 **UK** [1] - 51:18 ultimate [1] - 83:14 ultimately [6] - 4:4, 12:14, 16:18, 19:25, 24:6, 61:18 uncomfortable [1] - 34:8 **uncommonly** [1] - 63:3 under [7] - 54:14, 55:19, 55:21, 64:4, 64:5, 64:8, 74:3 understood [4] - 44:4, 51:16, 54:1 unfair [1] - 70:3 unfortunately [1] - 79:23 unhappy [1] - 64:21 universe [8] - 29:1, 29:4, 29:5, 52:9, 52:11, 52:20,

73:2, 74:4 unless [2] - 25:25, 65:13 unnoticed [1] - 4:19 unredacted [3] - 46:1, 74:4, 82:12 **up** [27] - 5:14, 8:16, 11:6, 11:23, 13:1, 17:1, 17:12, 17:18, 19:13, 20:15, 32:9, 45:24, 51:13, 53:3, 59:9, 60:2, 62:23, 63:4, 64:24, 65:1, 66:2, 71:3, 71:13, 78:19, 79:8, 80:22 **update** [14] - 8:18, 11:1, 11:4, 11:7, 14:6, 14:8, 21:1, 21:4, 27:24, 36:3, 36:7, 37:19, 44:20, 44:21 updates [19] - 5:8, 5:9, 5:12, 7:15, 8:22, 8:23, 8:24, 9:21, 10:21, 11:3, 13:10, 14:9, 14:11, 27:25, 30:9, 48:14, 84:16, 85:2 uploaded [2] - 22:23, 32:2 upset [1] - 67:15 useful [1] - 11:8 user [3] - 39:5, 41:15, 43:9 various [1] - 71:4 vendor [33] - 22:11, 23:4, 25:13, 25:14, 27:18, 28:16, 28:19, 28:20, 30:3, 31:18, 31:19, 34:24, 34:25, 35:8, 35:10, 42:22, 56:15, 65:25, 66:9, 66:10, 72:16, 72:21, 72:25, 73:2, 73:7, 73:11, 73:13, 74:5, 74:8, 83:7, 83:8, 83:13, 83:23 vendors [1] - 83:15 Venn [1] - 29:8 versions [1] - 74:5 **via** [4] - 6:7, 32:6, 32:16, 66:16 violated [1] - 81:25 violates [1] - 70:4 **violation** [2] - 34:18, 70:22 violations [1] - 4:7 virtual [1] - 46:17 virtue [1] - 22:20 voice [4] - 50:22, 50:25, 51:1, 51:12 voicemails [2] - 51:1, 51:18 wade [1] - 45:14 wait [1] - 67:3 waiting [1] - 79:13 waive [1] - 34:22 waived [3] - 52:16, 53:16, 55:15 wall [2] - 11:23, 12:6 WALTER [1] - 35:17 WALTON [52] - 23:5, 31:24, 32:11, 32:13, 33:10, 33:19, 34:14, 34:16, 35:14, 35:21,

36:10, 36:14, 36:18, 37:16, 38:3, 38:8, 38:21, 41:10, 41:15, 41:20, 41:24, 42:4, 42:15, 46:3, 50:15, 50:19, 51:15, 58:20, 58:23, 60:17, 60:21, 61:5, 61:8, 62:17, 63:16, 64:1, 64:10, 64:15, 64:17, 64:25, 65:4, 66:13, 66:15, 66:21, 67:6, 67:18, 68:20, 71:15, 82:15, 84:5, 84:12, 84:20 Walton [31] - 17:20, 17:25, 20:10, 31:23, 33:3, 36:6, 37:21, 41:8, 42:8, 45:22, 46:18, 47:6, 50:14, 57:23, 58:19, 60:13, 61:25, 62:4, 63:12, 63:25, 66:6, 66:12, 68:10, 68:11, 68:17, 69:14, 71:11, 73:8, 74:13, 82:14, 84:4 wants [3] - 59:15, 60:6, 69:17 ways [1] - 11:6 Wednesday [1] - 32:20 week [3] - 14:7, 30:10, 57:15 week-and-a-half [1] - 30:10 weekend [2] - 6:14, 85:3 weekly [1] - 36:7 weeks [4] - 3:5, 10:25, 13:1, 73:17 weigh [1] - 56:20 weighing [1] - 58:4 welcome [1] - 42:11 WhatsApp [2] - 40:15, 51:7 wheat [1] - 62:10 whole [4] - 18:3, 46:9, 62:8, 64:8 Wickr [1] - 39:8 wildly [1] - 60:15 willful [1] - 72:6 willing [2] - 72:20, 76:25 willy [1] - 79:19 willy-nilly [1] - 79:19 Windows [1] - 42:1 withheld [1] - 69:19 witnesses [1] - 37:2 **Wolson** [1] - 6:8 workaround [1] - 48:15 works [1] - 11:20 world [2] - 20:6, 20:8 write [1] - 82:7 wrote [1] - 17:23 year [1] - 47:15 years [1] - 57:9 yesterday[1] - 14:20 Yonchek [5] - 37:5, 37:22, 37:24, 45:10, 45:18 yourself [3] - 18:6, 24:24,

42:22

yourselves [2] - 75:14, 75:16

Zoom [1] - 46:19